

## Appendix 1: Muthill Conservation Area Appraisal - summary of responses

date received	name/organisation	summary of comments	response
Aug 2010	<b>Muthill and Tullibardine Community Council</b>	<p>General agreement with negative factors highlighted. 52 and 56 Willoughby Street are of particular concern. Also the vacant house at 107 Willoughby Street is a concern since it is a prominent building when entering the village from the south. Also prominent will be the bus park behind 107: if planning permission is granted then there should be strict conditions about screening.</p> <p>There are several recent front doors in the main part of the village which look out of place.</p> <p>Beaully-Denny 400kV transmission line: conditional ministerial consent has been given for pylons averaging 58 metres in height to run close to the north, east and south edges of the village and very close to the village cemetery. The Community Council draws attention to 9.1 of the draft Appraisal which states that it is important to preserve and enhance the setting of the conservation area and any development must not adversely affect this setting. Also, it states that existing tree belts should not be adversely affected. At 1.3 the Appraisal states that new development will normally only be granted planning permission if it can be demonstrated that it will not harm the character or visual quality of the area. The Community Council feels that the overhead line fails to come close to meeting any of these conditions. The Community Council continues to attempt to secure the undergrounding of the line past Muthill.</p>	<p>Comments on particular concerns are noted and these properties can be prioritised. The Conservation &amp; Regeneration Section plans to discuss the short and long term futures of these buildings with the current owners. The Conservation &amp; Regeneration Section has requested suitable conditions for screening/landscaping if planning consent is granted for the bus parking area.</p> <p>The proposed updated Article 4 Direction will cover door and window replacements.</p> <p>The Scottish Government granted consent for the high voltage transmission line in the national interest. No conditions of undergrounding were imposed on the line itself in the vicinity of Muthill village, despite representations made by Perth and Kinross Council. The Council recognises the impact this overhead line will have on the setting of Muthill and will endeavour to discuss any possible mitigation measures with Scottish Power and Scottish Hydro-Electric Transmission Ltd.</p> <p>Existing tree belts of high visual amenity considered to be under threat within the immediate setting of the conservation area will be considered for Tree Preservation Order status.</p>
Aug 2010	<b>Owner/occupier Address given: The Wynd, Muthill</b>	<p>A number of trees in the grounds of Pitkellony House are not mentioned. A path, well used by locals, goes through this area. Traffic in the village is an increasing problem which impinges on the attraction of the village. An increasing number of unsuitably large lorries seem to be routed through Muthill, some trying to negotiate the acute angled corner at the Cross and getting stuck and/or damaging property.</p> <p>The planned line of gigantic pylons seriously threatens the setting of the conservation area.</p>	<p>The importance of these trees to the setting of the conservation area is noted. TPO's will be considered for trees of high visual amenity which are under any real or actual threat.</p> <p>Concerns over heavy traffic through the village will be relayed to the Roads Authority.</p> <p>The Scottish Government granted consent for the high voltage transmission line in the national interest. No conditions of undergrounding were imposed on the line itself in the vicinity of Muthill village, despite representations made by Perth and Kinross Council. The Council recognises the impact this overhead line will have on the setting of Muthill and will endeavour to discuss any possible mitigation measures with Scottish Power and Scottish Hydro-Electric Transmission Ltd.</p>
Aug 2010	<b>D. Critchley</b>	<p>The large pylons will have a bad affect on the setting of the village. This would be resolved by the underground suggestion provided by the community council.</p>	<p>The Scottish Government granted consent for the high voltage transmission line in the national interest. No conditions of undergrounding were imposed on the line itself in the vicinity of Muthill village, despite representations made by Perth and Kinross Council. The Council recognises the impact this overhead line will have on the setting of Muthill and will endeavour to discuss any possible mitigation measures with Scottish Power and Scottish Hydro-Electric Transmission Ltd.</p>

date received	name/organisation	summary of comments	response
Aug 2010	<b>L. Critchley</b>	The overhead pylons will be double the height of Muthill Parish church. This will have a huge effect on the setting of the conservation area. This would be totally avoided by the underground section proposed by MTCC/Drummond Estate. Why if there's an opportunity to preserve Muthill Conservation Area is the Scottish Government giving authority to damage it?	The Scottish Government granted consent for the high voltage transmission line in the national interest. No conditions of undergrounding were imposed on the line itself in the vicinity of Muthill village, despite representations made by Perth and Kinross Council. The Council recognises the impact this overhead line will have on the setting of Muthill and will endeavour to discuss any possible mitigation measures with Scottish Power and Scottish Hydro-Electric Transmission Ltd.
Aug 2010	<b>E. Critchley</b>	It is widely recognised that Muthill is a village of considerable architectural interest. This will be deeply affected by the pylon line. Surely these dinosaurs on the landscape will have a devastating effect on the setting of this treasured conservation area?	The Scottish Government granted consent for the high voltage transmission line in the national interest. No conditions of undergrounding were imposed on the line itself in the vicinity of Muthill village, despite representations made by Perth and Kinross Council. The Council recognises the impact this overhead line will have on the setting of Muthill and will endeavour to discuss any possible mitigation measures with Scottish Power and Scottish Hydro-Electric Transmission Ltd.
Aug 2010	<b>I. Sinclair</b>	To develop an area as one of "conservation" and simultaneously skirt by with totally incongruous pylons does raise some questions. How these proposals, which appear sound in principle, can ignore the pylons is beyond comprehension. The Muthill Conservation area is a great concept so why ruin it with the pylon developments?	The Scottish Government granted consent for the high voltage transmission line in the national interest. No conditions of undergrounding were imposed on the line itself in the vicinity of Muthill village, despite representations made by Perth and Kinross Council. The Council recognises the impact this overhead line will have on the setting of Muthill and will endeavour to discuss any possible mitigation measures with Scottish Power and Scottish Hydro-Electric Transmission Ltd.
Aug 2010	<b>N. Ozkan</b>	Muthill and surrounding areas are amongst the prettiest in Perthshire. Considering there is an alternative to the wind turbines, the plan to alter the landscape is very unfair. Concern that there will be no countryside left in years to come as long as the price is right for sale of land. Very sad.	The Scottish Government granted consent for the high voltage transmission line in the national interest. No conditions of undergrounding were imposed on the line itself in the vicinity of Muthill village, despite representations made by Perth and Kinross Council. The Council recognises the impact this overhead line will have on the setting of Muthill and will endeavour to discuss any possible mitigation measures with Scottish Power and Scottish Hydro-Electric Transmission Ltd.
Aug 2010	<b>D. Griffiths</b>	Conservation is not just about protecting a bounded area, but also protecting the surrounding area to ensure access, by wildlife, residents and tourists, is maintained. Therefore, alterations occurring around the area can have an indirect consequence. Muthill has many features, buildings and trees which deserve protection to ensure future generations can see how traditional Scottish villages were, and can themselves enjoy those charms.	<p>Under Town and Country Planning legislation the local planning authority is required to determine which parts of its area are of special architectural and/or historic interest and to designate conservation areas accordingly. A conservation area covers the traditional townscape and built heritage of a town or village. A conservation area should be reasonably compact and clearly defined. It would not be appropriate or feasible to include wider rural areas around Muthill. However, the immediate setting of the conservation area is important and recognised as such through development plan policy.</p> <p>There is also a Garden and Designed Landscape immediately north of the village. Development affecting the settings of both the Muthill Conservation Area and the Drummond Castle Designed Landscape are material considerations for any planning applications in the area. TPO's will be considered for trees which are considered important to the setting of the conservation area.</p>

date received	name/organisation	summary of comments	response
Aug 2010	not provided	<p>The objectives are sound but would like to see more colour (paintwork) in the village. Although a conservation village some of it is rather drab.</p> <p>The copper beech tree(s) at the church entrance obscures the view of the church approaching from the east in the summer months, just leaving the steeple. Could the trees be trimmed?</p>	<p>Comments on colour are noted. A variety of colours can add vibrancy to the townscape but it is important not to distort historical character by using an inappropriate treatment or finish. A variety of window and window surround colours exist within the village and this variety of traditional colours will be encouraged where appropriate.</p> <p>The beech trees provide an attractive natural foil to the church and are an integral part of the designed landscape of the church grounds.</p>
27 Aug 2010	not provided	<p>Almost all of the negative areas highlighted have been allowed to happen and most have been perpetrated by the Council itself: cluttered signage, unsympathetic barriers and street furniture, uPVC windows and concrete roof tiles on Council buildings, demolition of listed walls. The public perception is that the conservation area status makes no difference when the Council carry out any work. Little consideration of conservation status has been taken when allowing major developments in the village: at the west end of Drummond Street and the proposed development at Lindores. The Council has shown no support for public concern over the proposed sighting of the new powerline nor have they had any impact on the proposed routing of heavy construction traffic through the conservation area.</p> <p>In contrast the Council are severe when dealing with home owners and small businesses. Plans have to be millimetre perfect and full elevations have to be provided for the most minor work. Over interpretation of the laws mean that home owners and small businesses cannot afford to carry out essential maintenance work causing properties to fall into dis-repair. The protection of the buildings in Muthill would be better served if the conservation area status was removed and normal planning restrictions were in force.</p>	<p>The re-appraisal of Muthill Conservation Area identifies the qualities and features of the built heritage and areas or buildings which could be improved. Conservation area status provides the opportunity for the implementation of enhancement schemes. It is considered important to have a management strategy which covers large-scale and small-scale development. Small-scale developments or alterations may not be significant individually but cumulatively can erode the historic fabric and visual quality of the townscape.</p> <p>An Article 4 Direction would not only cover householders, it would also cover development or works by the local authority and statutory undertakers as well.</p> <p>The concerns about the impact of the housing development at the west end of Drummond Street, in the setting of the conservation area, are noted. The development site at Lindores is located within an existing landscape framework and the density and scale of the development is considered acceptable in this edge of settlement location, subject to planning conditions.</p> <p>The Scottish Government granted consent for the high voltage transmission line in the national interest. No conditions of undergrounding were imposed on the line itself in the vicinity of Muthill village, despite representations made by Perth and Kinross Council. The Council recognises the impact this overhead line will have on the setting of Muthill and will endeavour to discuss any possible mitigation measures with Scottish Power and Scottish Hydro-Electric Transmission Ltd.</p>
27 Aug 2010	not provided	<p>The Yew trees in the churchyard should be protected, especially in light of the removal of one around ten years ago.</p> <p>The Cross (at the school) and The Toll (at the old church) and the area around the shop and crossing would certainly benefit from attention. Bishop's Green did not need attention until the Council gave permission for pointless removal of trees.</p> <p>Remedial action would be welcome for the old surgery and the vacant house at the petrol station. Understanding is that there are problems with planning permissions which is preventing the improvements of these buildings. Perhaps a more sympathetic approach with assistance from the C&amp;R team would help.</p> <p>The old garage at the War Memorial is on the whole a positive feature, not a negative. People stop to photograph it. Could do with a tidy-up maybe.</p>	<p>Any proposed tree works within the conservation area must be notified to the local planning authority for consideration and assessment.</p> <p>The Conservation &amp; Regeneration Section will liaise with Parks and Recreation and discuss how the Bishop's Green could be enhanced with a soft landscaping scheme.</p> <p>Not aware of any planning restrictions on the vacant house adjacent to the petrol station. A planning application for change of use to residential for the ground floor of the old surgery was withdrawn in 2007 as amenity space standards were not being met. Ultimately it is the responsibility of the building owners to keep the properties in reasonable condition. Discussions will be welcomed with the current owners of these buildings to assess their conservation needs and to investigate suitable uses to secure their long-term future.</p>

date received	name/organisation	summary of comments	response
27 Aug 2010	<b>A. Erskine</b>	<p>The conservation area boundary should include the beech trees to the north of Wardside up to the entrance to Wardside House. The trees are a feature driving down Wardside.</p> <p>The Appraisal rightly identifies Bishop's Green as a negative, but it was PKC who messed it up. The drainage was always poor but the removal of trees and the infill of the burn has made it worse.</p>	<p>Agreed. These trees will be included and the boundary amended accordingly.</p> <p>The Conservation &amp; Regeneration Section will liaise with Parks and Recreation and discuss how the Bishop's Green could be enhanced with a soft landscaping scheme.</p>
27 Aug 2010	<b>J. Abbott</b>	<p>The exhibition was informative. Anything that can be done to preserve and enhance the distinctive features of the village is to be welcomed.</p> <p>The recent housing development to the west of Drummond Street is an intrusion and out of character with the conservation area. The Appraisal mentions other areas for possible housing development which hopefully will not come to fruition and should be resisted. Any further housing on the edge of/outwith the conservation area would create an increase in traffic to the detriment of the village environment. Far better to utilise the gap sites identified if need be. The open spaces around the village should be preserved at all costs.</p>	<p>The concerns about the impact of the housing development at the west end of Drummond Street, in the setting of the conservation area, are noted.</p> <p>Designation as a conservation area does not necessarily place a ban upon all new development on the edge of or outwith the conservation area. However, any new development will only be granted planning consent if it is in line with development plan policy and it can be demonstrated that it will not harm the character or visual quality of the area and the setting of the conservation area is not adversely affected.</p> <p>Gap sites will be considered for suitable infill development.</p>
1 Sep 2010	not provided	<p>The section between Willoughby Street and Station Road should be included within the proposed boundary.</p>	<p>The extended gardens behind Willoughby Street have been included within the extended boundary as they are an integral part of the village townscape and meet the criteria for special historic significance. The rural area beyond this is not considered to be an integral part of the townscape but is within the immediate setting of the conservation area. Outline planning permission currently exists for housing development in this area. The design and scale of any housing development in this area must not adversely affect this setting.</p>
9 Sep 2010	<b>O &amp; J Goodall</b>	<p>The boundary can only work if PKC pay effective attention to the nearby areas to the conservation area. Erosion has taken place around the area constantly. Plans have been accepted for 1.5 storey houses. Any more promises of strength which end in weakness will lead to gradual erosion of the village. When trees are felled planned houses will follow. Strong action on negative areas should be carried out.</p>	<p>The immediate setting of the conservation area is important and recognised as such through development plan policy. There is also a Garden and Designed Landscape immediately north of the village. Development affecting the settings of both the Muthill Conservation Area and the Drummond Castle Designed Landscape are material considerations for any planning applications in the area. TPO's will be considered for trees which are considered important to the setting of the conservation area.</p>
9 Sep 2010	<b>A. Holland</b>	<p>The Appraisal is thorough. Tight regulations are required to ensure protection of Muthill. Cannot understand how commercial vehicles are allowed to speed through the village. Also cannot understand how the Beauldy-Denny powerline has not been made to go underground by PKC.</p>	<p>Concerns over heavy traffic through the village will be relayed to the Roads Authority.</p> <p>The Scottish Government granted consent for the high voltage transmission line in the national interest. No conditions of undergrounding were imposed on the line itself in the vicinity of Muthill village, despite representations made by Perth and Kinross Council. The Council recognises the impact this overhead line will have on the setting of Muthill and will endeavour to discuss any possible mitigation measures with Scottish Power and Scottish Hydro-Electric Transmission Ltd.</p>

date received	name/organisation	summary of comments	response
15 Sep 2010	<b>O. Goodall</b>	The landscape to the east of Muthill is not mentioned as much as that to the west. The landscape to the east is full of old park lands, woods, orchards. This area will be adversely affected by pylons higher than the Kirk tower. The setting of the conservation area should be protected.	<p>The Drummond Castle Garden and Designed Landscape is specifically mentioned in the Appraisal. The overall setting of the conservation area is also recognised.</p> <p>The Scottish Government granted consent for the high voltage transmission line in the national interest. No conditions of undergrounding were imposed on the line itself in the vicinity of Muthill village, despite representations made by Perth and Kinross Council. The Council recognises the impact this overhead line will have on the setting of Muthill and will endeavour to discuss any possible mitigation measures with Scottish Power and Scottish Hydro-Electric Transmission Ltd.</p>
22 Sep 2010	<b>I. Barker</b>	The overhead pylons will be detrimental to the setting of the village conservation area.	<p>The Scottish Government granted consent for the high voltage transmission line in the national interest. No conditions of undergrounding were imposed on the line itself in the vicinity of Muthill village, despite representations made by Perth and Kinross Council. The Council recognises the impact this overhead line will have on the setting of Muthill and will endeavour to discuss any possible mitigation measures with Scottish Power and Scottish Hydro-Electric Transmission Ltd.</p>
22 Sep 2010	<b>B. Critchley</b>	The size of the pylons will be three times the height of the mature oaks that line the A822 near Muthill Cemetery. The setting of the village will not be preserved. So regarding the guidance given by PKC at para. 9.1, the setting of the conservation area will be better met by the proposed MTCC/Drummond Estate underground section. Apart from that the Appraisal is a good, well researched document.	<p>The Scottish Government granted consent for the high voltage transmission line in the national interest. No conditions of undergrounding were imposed on the line itself in the vicinity of Muthill village, despite representations made by Perth and Kinross Council. The Council recognises the impact this overhead line will have on the setting of Muthill and will endeavour to discuss any possible mitigation measures with Scottish Power and Scottish Hydro-Electric Transmission Ltd.</p>
4 Oct 2010	<b>A. Cannon</b>	<p>The greatest negative will be the powerline development. The Conservation team should use every avenue to fight for the Community Council's plan for re-routing and undergrounding of these cables. If this is not done the village setting will be ruined.</p> <p>One key view area from Drummond Street to the north has been given planning permission for three large houses. This was not mentioned and should have been resisted. Great focus on the minute (windows, doors) but none on the overview, ie. powerlines and more large houses similar to the ones that scar the end of the village.</p>	<p>The Scottish Government granted consent for the high voltage transmission line in the national interest. No conditions of undergrounding were imposed on the line itself in the vicinity of Muthill village, despite representations made by Perth and Kinross Council. The Council recognises the impact this overhead line will have on the setting of Muthill and will endeavour to discuss any possible mitigation measures with Scottish Power and Scottish Hydro-Electric Transmission Ltd.</p> <p>The view referred to is a glimpse view between houses in Drummond Street to the landscape framework beyond. The development site at Lindores is located within an existing landscape framework and the density and scale of the development is considered acceptable in this edge of settlement location, subject to planning conditions.</p>

date received	name/organisation	summary of comments	response
12 Nov 2010	<b>F.Critchley</b>	The conservation area will be adversely affected by the large pylon powerline. The powerline would stand out in your views from anywhere in this conservation area. These pylons are not wanted in this beautiful area and would destroy the conservation area which means so much to the locals.	The Scottish Government granted consent for the high voltage transmission line in the national interest. No conditions of undergrounding were imposed on the line itself in the vicinity of Muthill village, despite representations made by Perth and Kinross Council. The Council recognises the impact this overhead line will have on the setting of Muthill and will endeavour to discuss any possible mitigation measures with Scottish Power and Scottish Hydro-Electric Transmission Ltd.
19 Nov 2010	<b>P.Oram</b>	40 Willoughby Street (Masonic Lodge): the front windows are an eyesore and in poor condition. The glass has been replaced with "perspex" and cannot be cleaned. 39 Willoughby Street (the Wee Hall): more perspex and wood boarding up the windows.	These concerns are noted and discussions with the building's owners will be welcomed.