

DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE

Minute of Meeting of the Development Control Committee held in the Council Chambers, Fourth Floor, Council Building, 2 High Street, Perth on Wednesday 2 August 2006 at 9.30am.

Present: Councillors Barnacle, Caddell, E Grant, Howie (until 06/00839/OUT), Hulbert, Livingstone (until 06/00512/FUL), Lumsden, Lyall, McDonald, McEwen, MacLellan and Young.

Attending: Councillor Lloyd (except for 06/00585/FUL and 06/00644/FUL) and Councillor Miller (from 06/00814/OUT); I Sleith, J Robertson, G McFarlane, J M Watson, D Niven and A Fleming (all The Environment Service); C Elliot, J Dickson, Y Oliver and D Anderson (all Corporate Services).

Councillor Lumsden, Convener, Presiding.

491. RESIGNATION FROM THE COMMITTEE

The Convener intimated that Councillor Bushby had resigned as a member of the Development Control Committee.

492. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

There were no declarations of interest made in terms of the Councillors' Code of Conduct.

493. MINUTE OF PREVIOUS MEETING

The minute of meeting of the Development Control Committee of 5 July 2006 (Arts. 473-479) was submitted, approved as a correct record and authorised for signature.

494. DEPUTATIONS

In terms of Standing Order 59, the Committee agreed to hear deputations in relation to planning applications as follows:-

Planning Application No.	Article No.
06/00397/FUL	495(2)
06/00497/TD (Revised)	497(1)
05/00625/FUL	499(1)
05/02217/OUT	499(2)
06/00512/FUL	499(3)
06/00814/OUT	499(6)
06/00839/OUT	499(7)
06/01291/FUL	499(10)
06/01352/FUL	499(11)

495. PLANNING APPLICATIONS PREVIOUSLY CONSIDERED

- (1) **05/02416/OUT - KINFAUNS - Erection of 5-star hotel and ancillary facilities (in outline) at land adjacent to A90, south of Burnfoot, Kinfauns - JWK Properties - Report 06/539 and 06/539(a) (Art. 479(4)).**

The Committee noted in terms of Standing Order 18, that as Councillor MacLellan had not been present at the meeting on 5 July 2006 when this application was considered previously, he did not participate in the discussion and the taking of the decision today.

There was submitted a report by the Head of Development Standards (06/539) setting out reasons for the departure from the Development Plan together with planning conditions for endorsement, prior to referring the application to Scottish Ministers following the decision of the Development Control Committee on 5 July

2006 to approve the application. There was also submitted a supplementary report by the Head of Development Standards (06/539(a)) advising that (1) comments had been received from Historic Scotland on the proposals, as set out in their letter of 20 July 2006, and (2) Scottish Natural Heritage would remove their formal objection to the proposal, subject to approval of Condition 7, as detailed in Report 06/539.

Resolved:

- (i) The planning application be granted, subject to the following conditions;
 1. The following reserved matters: the siting, design and external appearance of the development, the landscaping of the site, all means of enclosure, the car parking and means of access to the site shall be as approved by the Planning Authority.
 2. The reserved matters shall be submitted for the approval of the Planning Authority in the form of a written application accompanied by detailed plans not later than:
 - (i) the expiration of 3 years from the date of the grant of outline planning permission.
 - (ii) the expiration of 6 months from the date on which an earlier application for such approval was refused, or
 - (iii) the expiration of 6 months from the date on which an appeal against such refusal was dismissed;whichever is the latest.
 3. The development to which this permission relates must be begun not later than:
 - (i) Five years from the date of the permission; or
 - (ii) Two years from the date of the final approval of all reserved matters.
 4. The premises shall be used solely for the purposes of a five-star hotel, the elements and quality of which should fit the description of "iconic and unique to Perth". The use of the premises for any other purpose, including another purpose in Class 7 of the Schedule to the Town and Country Planning (Use Classes)(Scotland) Order 1998, will require to be the subject of a further planning application to the Planning Authority.
 5. The quality of design of the building, its facilities and landscaped context shall be similar to that illustrated in the approved Masterplan all to the satisfaction of the Council as Planning Authority.
 6. Development should not begin until a scheme to deal with the contamination on the site has been submitted to and approved in writing by the planning authority. The scheme shall contain proposals to deal with the contamination to include:
 - (i) the nature, extent and type(s) of contamination on the site
 - (ii) measures to treat/remove contamination to ensure the site is fit for the use proposed
 - (iii) measures to deal with contamination during construction works
 - (iv) condition of the site on completion of decontamination measuresBefore any residential unit is occupied the measures to decontaminate the site shall be fully implemented as approved by the planning authority.
 7. The applicant shall submit as a reserved matter a fully detailed construction method statement to be prepared and agreed by the Council prior to the commencement of construction, giving details of the following measures to ensure materials cannot leach into watercourses:
 - a) Pollution prevention, including the possible use of siltation traps, settlement tanks and bunds
 - b) Material, fuel and chemical storage – appropriate siting of stock piles and use of buffer strips, bunding and fencing

- c) All work associated with the proposal shall be strictly undertaken in accordance with the water and sewerage measures outlined in section 4.11 'Water Quality and Drainage Effluent Treatment' of the supporting information.
8. No development shall commence until evidence is exhibited to this Planning Authority that an agreement has been reached by the applicant with Scottish Water for the provision of a water scheme to serve the development all to the satisfaction of the Council as Planning Authority.
 9. All matters regarding access, car parking, road layout, design and specification, including the disposal of surface water, shall be in accordance with the standards required by the Council as Roads Authority and to the satisfaction of the Planning Authority.
 10. Turning facilities shall be provided within the site to enable all vehicles to enter and leave in a forward gear.
 11. All measures included in the approved Transport Statement for the development, including the possible provision of a park and ride facility shall be submitted as reserved matters.
 12. No development shall be commenced until the Kinfauns Grade Separated Interchange on the A90 has been completed.
 13. There shall be no means of direct vehicular or pedestrian access to the trunk road for either the construction or operation of the development.
 14. Prior to the commencement of any development a barrier of a type approved by the planning authority, after consultation with the TS-TRNMD, shall be provided and maintained along the proposed boundary of the site with the trunk road.
 15. Prior to the occupation of the proposed development a shelter shall be provided at the relocated eastbound bus stop on the A90 at Kinfauns. The specification and location of the shelter shall be agreed in writing with the planning authority, after consultation with TS-TRNMD.
 16. Concomitant with the occupation of the proposed development a private bus service shall be introduced for use by both staff and guests. The operational details of this shall be defined within the Green Travel Plan referred to in Condition 17.
 17. No part of the development shall be occupied until a Green Travel Plan, aimed to encourage more sustainable means of travel by both staff and customers, has been submitted to and approved in writing by the planning authority, in consultation with TS-TRNMD. The Green Travel Plan shall identify the measures to be implemented, the system of management, monitoring, review, reporting and the duration of the plan and will include, inter alia:
 - Details of proposed pedestrian and cycle infrastructure within the site and connections to the existing networks.
 - Details of proposed measures to improve the existing public transport facilities such as service enhancements, provision of timetable information and season ticket initiatives
 - Details of the operation and management of the proposed courtesy bus service between Perth, Kinfauns and Dundee
 - Details of the proposed monitoring schedule and reporting procedures.
 - Details of the overall management of the travel plan identifying the persons responsible for implementation.
- (ii) It be remitted to the Head of Development Standards, in consultation with the Convener and Vice-Convener, to formulate the justification for the departure from the Development Plan prior to referring the application to Scottish Ministers.

(2) 06/00397/FUL - ABERNETHY - Erection of conservatory at 10 Main Street, Abernethy - M Cole - Report 06/540 (Art. 479(8)).

The Committee noted in terms of Standing Order 18, that as Councillor MacLellan had not been present at the meeting on 5 July 2006 when this application was considered previously, he did not participate in the discussion and the taking of the decision today.

Mr Venn, representing the applicant, addressed the Committee, and following his representation, withdrew to the public benches.

Resolved:

Refuse, for the following reasons:

1. The proposal is contrary to Policy 71 of the Perth Area Local Plan 1995, incorporating Alteration No1 – Housing Land 2000, as it represents an incongruous and unsympathetic addition which will adversely affect the visual character of the host building and surrounding area.
2. The proposal is contrary to Policy 74 of the Perth Area Local Plan 1995, incorporating Alteration No1 – Housing Land 2000, and Environment and Resources Policy 8 of the Structure Plan as it represents an incongruous and unsympathetic addition which will adversely affect the character of the Conservation Area.
3. The proposal is contrary to Historic Scotland's Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas especially Section 4 and to the statutory requirement under Section 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 to preserve and enhance the character and appearance of Conservation Areas, as it represents an incongruous and unsympathetic addition to the building.

496. APPEAL DECISION REGARDING WINDFARM DEVELOPMENT AT GREEN KNOWES, GLENDEVON, AUCHTERARDER - CRE ENERGY - REPORT 06/554 (Art. 870(1)/05)

There was submitted a report by the Head of Development Standards (06/554) advising of the outcome of the Public Inquiry into the Green Knowes 1 windfarm development proposal and the Reporter's decision to sustain the appeal by CRE Energy and issue planning consent. The Appendix to Report 06/554 detailed the reasons for the Reporter's determination. The report also provided an update on the position regarding the other windfarm appeals in the Ochil Hills.

Members' noted the content of the report, expressed concern at the Reporter's findings, and disappointment that the appeal decision would not be challenged in the Court of Session.

It was suggested and agreed that the Head of Development Standards write to the Chief Reporter pointing out that the cumulative impact of the windfarms in the Ochils had not been taken into account in this instance and request an explanation for that, particularly as it presented an inconsistency between the Green Knowes Inquiry with that of the Ochil Hills windfarm conjoined appeals when conjoined matters, policy and the cumulative impact of the other applications would be taken into account.

497. PLANNING APPLICATION FOR TELECOMMUNICATIONS DEVELOPMENT PREVIOUSLY CONSIDERED

(1) 06/00497/TD (Revised) - CRIEFF - Installation of 6m high telecommunications flagpole and 0.3m transmission dish with ancillary equipment, Drummond Arms Hotel, Crieff - Hutchison 3G UK Ltd - Report 06/541 (Art. 313).

The Committee noted in terms of Standing Order 18 that as Councillors Caddell, Livingstone and MacLellan had not been present at the meeting on 10 May 2006 when the application was considered previously they did not take part in the discussion or the decision today.

Mr Alexander, representing the applicant, followed by Mr Robertson and Miss Boxer, objectors to the application, addressed the Committee, and following their respective representations, withdrew to the public benches.

A Motion by Councillor Hulbert to grant the application subject to the conditions detailed in Report 06/541 failed to find a seconder.

Resolved:

The application be **refused** on the grounds of inadequate consultation with the local community.

498. DEVELOPMENT BY PERTH AND KINROSS COUNCIL

- (1) **06/01114/NID - PERTH - Erection of education establishment (Additional Support Needs School) at Perth Academy, Murray Place, Perth - Perth and Kinross Council - Report 06/542.**

Resolved:

Grant, subject to the following conditions:

1. The development shall be begun within a period of five years from the date of this consent.
2. The proposed development must be carried out in accordance with the approved plans, unless otherwise provided for by conditions imposed on the planning consent.
3. All matters regarding access, car parking, road layout, design and specification (including street lighting and disposal of surface water) shall be in accordance with the standards required by the Council as Roads Authority.
4. Prior to the commencement of any development (including demolition and the importation of plant, materials and machinery), all trees within the site which are shown on the approved plans as being retained, together with those trees outwith but overhanging the site, shall be protected to BS 5837:1991 by chespale fencing fixed top and bottom to horizontal rails, all on 75mm treated posts, to a height of 1200mm. The fencing shall be set no closer to the trees than their canopy spread, and shall remain intact for the duration of construction works, unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Planning Authority. No construction work, changes to levels, or storage of plant or materials shall take place within the protected zone.
5. Services shall be grouped together in the same trench wherever possible and shall be positioned outwith the canopy spread of the trees to be retained. If trenches need to be excavated within the canopy spread, a trench should only be dug on one side of the tree. The routing and excavation of trenches and provision of services shall be in accordance with Publication No. 10 of the National Joint Utilities Code of Practice and BS 5837 2005: Trees In Relation To Construction.
6. The adjacent hockey pitch which is to be retained and repositioned shall be reconstructed and drained in accordance with specifications to be agreed with the Planning Authority in consultation with Sportscotland.
7. No part of the development shall be occupied until a Travel Plan for staff and pupils, aimed to encourage more sustainable means of travel, has been submitted and approved in writing by the Council. The Travel Plan will have particular regard to provision for walking, cycling and public transport access to and within the site and will identify the measures to be provided, the system of management, monitoring, review, reporting and the duration of the plan.

499. PLANNING APPLICATIONS FOR DETERMINATION

- (1) **05/00625/FUL - MEIGLE - Formation of cycle/motor bike recreational track at land at Mains of Arthurstone Farm, Meigle - C and J Patterson - Report 06/543.**

The Head of Development Standards advised Members of the content of a letter of objection from the owner of the property nearest to the proposed development site.

Mr Coutts, representing the applicant, followed by Mr Penman, representing a group of objectors, and Mr Barron, an objector, addressed the Committee. The Committee also agreed to hear a deputation from Mrs Sandy Bushby, representing Strathmore Golf Centre, who had objected to the application. Following their respective representations, Mr Coutts, Mr Penman, Mr Barron and Mrs Bushby withdrew to the public benches. Mrs Bushby withdrew from the meeting at this point.

Motion (Councillors Lyall and Livingstone) - Grant, subject to the following conditions:

1. **Consent is hereby granted for a limited period until 30 September 2008.**
2. **Prior to the commencement of any works on site precise details of all temporary buildings/structures are submitted for approval in writing by the Council as Planning Authority.**
3. **A detailed landscaping and planting scheme for the site shall be submitted for the further approval of the Council as Planning Authority prior to the commencement of any further works on site. The scheme shall include details of the height and slopes of the mounding and recontouring of the site, species, height, size and density of the trees and shrubs to be planted and the scheme as approved shall be carried out and completed within a timescale agreed in writing by the Council as Planning Authority.**
4. **The Council as Planning Authority should be informed in writing of any change to the circuit layout prior to the change being implemented.**
5. **Prior to the commencement of any works on site precise details of the size of the raised bale banks are submitted for approval in writing by the Council as Planning Authority.**
6. **The vehicular access shall be formed in accordance with specification Type C, Fig 5.7 access detail to the satisfaction of the Planning Authority.**
7. **The public road over a length of 10m immediately adjacent to the access shall be widened to a minimum of 5m.**
8. **The gradient of the access shall not exceed 3% for the first 3 metres measured back from the edge of the carriageway and the access shall be constructed so that no surface water is discharged to the public road.**
9. **Full visibility splays of 3m by 110m shall be provided to the right and left of the access measured between points 1m above the adjacent road channel level.**
10. **Turning facilities shall be provided within the site to enable all vehicles to enter and leave in a forward gear**
11. **Adequate car parking spaces shall be provided within the site to the satisfaction of the Council as Planning Authority.**
12. **Storm water drainage from all paved surfaces, including the access, shall be disposed of by means of suitable sustainable urban drainage systems to meet the requirements of best management practices.**
13. **Appropriate signing for the facility, to the requirements of the Council as Roads Authority, shall be provided on the A94 Perth/Forfar Road and other surrounding roads, all to the satisfaction of the Planning Authority.**
14. **Any planting failing to become established within 3 years shall be replaced in the following planting season with others of similar size and species.**

15. The proposed Management Plan as approved for the Motocross Track shall be implemented in full to the satisfaction of the Council as Planning Authority.
16. Adequate precautions shall be taken to prevent contamination of the site or any watercourse from oils, fuels, hydraulic fluids and antifreeze to be stored or used on site.
17. The public address system proposed in the Management Plan is not approved. No public address system shall operate on the site.
18. No floodlighting is permitted within the site.
19. The proposed development must be carried out in accordance with the approved plans, unless otherwise provided for by conditions imposed on the planning consent.

Councillors Lyall and Livingstone with the consent of the mover and seconder, proposed an additional condition as follows:

20. The motorcycles shall have standard exhaust systems and be suitably silenced to reduce noise impact and noise levels shall be monitored to ensure that they are within World Health Organisation guidelines.

Amendment (Councillors Young and Barnacle) - Refuse, on the grounds that the proposal fails to meet the Eastern Area Local Plan 1998 Sustainable Economy Policy 3 as the proposal would not maintain or enhance local employment opportunities; Sustainable Development Policy 2 as there is no landscape framework capable of absorbing or screening the development; General Policies Policy 38 and Rural Land Use Policy 40.

Amendment - 5 votes

Motion - 6 votes

Resolved:

In accordance with the Motion.

- (2) **05/02217/OUT - ABERUTHVEN - Erection of 31 dwellinghouses (in outline) at land at Hall Road, Aberuthven, Auchterarder - Tighmor - Report 06/544.**

Mrs Bell, an objector to the application, addressed the Committee, and following her representation, withdrew to the public benches.

Resolved:

Grant, subject to (1) the prior signing of a Section 75 agreement to secure the provision and maintenance of the drainage infrastructure and to the subsequent connection to the public drainage system; and (2) the following conditions:

1. The following reserved matters: the siting, design and external appearance of the development, the landscaping of the site, all means of enclosure, the car parking and means of access to the site shall be as approved by the Planning Authority.
2. The reserved matters shall be submitted for the approval of the Planning Authority in the form of a written application accompanied by detailed plans not later than:
 - (i) the expiration of 3 years from the date of the grant of outline planning permission.
 - (ii) the expiration of 6 months from the date on which an earlier application for such approval was refused, or
 - (iii) the expiration of 6 months from the date on which an appeal against such refusal was dismissed;
 whichever is the latest.
3. The development to which this permission relates must be begun not later than:
 - (i) Five years from the date of the permission; or
 - (ii) Two years from the date of the final approval of all reserved matters.
4. Development shall not commence until a scheme to deal with contamination on the site has been submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority. The scheme shall cover the nature and type of contamination, measures to

- treat/remove contamination, and measures to deal with contamination during construction and condition of the site on completion of decontamination.
5. No dwellinghouse shall be occupied until measures to decontaminate the site have been implemented to the satisfaction of the Planning Authority.
 6. There shall be no means of direct access, either pedestrian or vehicular, and no drainage connection to the A9 trunk road.
 7. An un-climbable fence, of a type approved by the Planning Authority, shall be provided and maintained along the boundary of the site with the A9 trunk road.
 8. The landscaping scheme shall be implemented concurrently with the progress of development and thereafter maintained to the satisfaction of the Planning Authority.
 9. A play area of a type which meets the Council's standards shall be provided within the site, details to be submitted as part of the reserved matters required by condition 1 above.
 10. A minimum of eight houses shall be affordable as defined in the Council's Policy on Affordable Housing and PAN 74.
 11. No commitment is given in this consent to the notional housing layout forming part of the submission.
 12. Provision shall be made for a pedestrian link between the site and Hall Road and for a vehicular link between site and the housing site H20 on the opposite side of Hall Road and details shall be provided as part of the reserved matters required by condition 1 above.
 13. No houses shall be occupied until a suitable means of vehicular and pedestrian access to the site has been provided from Main Street, to the satisfaction of the Planning Authority.

COUNCILLOR LIVINGSTONE LEFT THE MEETING AT THIS POINT.

(3) 06/00512/FUL - COUPAR ANGUS - Erection of 2 dwellinghouses on site adjacent to 30 Holding, Coupar Angus, Blairgowrie, Perthshire - G Burke - Report 06/545.

Mr Hynd, representing the applicant, and Mrs Riddell-Webster, an objector to the application, addressed the Committee, and following their respective representations, withdrew to the public benches.

IN TERMS OF STANDING ORDER 53, COUNCILLOR LLOYD, THE LOCAL MEMBER, ADDRESSED THE COMMITTEE.

Motion (Councillors E Grant and Young) - Refuse, on the grounds that the proposal contravenes the Eastern Area Local Plan 1998 (1) Policy 49 Housing in the Countryside as the proposal is not in accord with the building line of the group and could lead to ribbon development, and (2) Policy 38 as there is no occupational need.

Amendment (Councillors Lumsden and Barnacle) - Grant, subject to the conditions detailed in Report 06/545.

Amendment - 5 votes

Motion - 6 votes

Resolved:

In accordance with the Motion.

COUNCILLOR LLOYD LEFT THE MEETING DURING CONSIDERATION OF THE FOLLOWING ITEM.

- (4) **06/00585/FUL - BANKFOOT - Extension to dwellinghouse at Lawers, Main Street, Bankfoot, Perth - Mr and Mrs Hutchison - Report 06/546.**

Resolved:

Grant, subject to conditions to be formulated by the Head of Development Standards, including conditions that (1) the external finish of the extension shall be white rendered walls and grey roof tiles, and (2) the height of the extension shall not be higher than the ridge line of the host building.

- (5) **06/00644/FUL - PITLOCHRY - Erection of 10 flats (3 blocks) on land to rear of MacKay's Hotel, Birnam Place, Pitlochry, Perthshire - Proplacement Ltd - Report 06/547.**

Resolved:

Refuse, for the following reasons:

1. The proposals are contrary to Policies 78 of The Highland Area Local Plan 2000, in that the site is presently zoned for "Town Centre Uses" where shops, offices, restaurants, public houses and hotels are considered to be the predominant use.
2. The proposals constitute an overdevelopment of the site to the detriment of the established building pattern, visual and residential amenity of the surrounding area and are accordingly contrary to the criteria laid down in policies 2 & 4 of The Highland Area Local Plan 2000.
3. The proposals by virtue of their size, scale, design and potential for overlooking existing properties would result in an obtrusive element in the street scene, out of keeping with the traditional character of the proposed conservation area, to the detriment of the visual and residential amenity of the surrounding area.
4. No provision has been made within the development to address or contribute to the Council's Policy on Affordable Homes.

FOLLOWING A FIVE MINUTE RECESS THE COMMITTEE RECONVENED.

COUNCILLOR MILLER ENTERED THE MEETING AND COUNCILLOR LLOYD REJOINED THE MEETING AT THIS STAGE.

- (6) **06/00814/OUT - DUNNING - Demolition of existing scout hut and erection of single dwellinghouse adjacent to St Serfs Church, Kirk Wynd, Dunning - Douglas Smith - Report 06/548.**

Mr MacLean, representing the applicant, addressed the Committee, and following his representation, withdrew to the public benches.

Motion (Councillors Howie and Caddell) - Grant, on the grounds that the departure from the Development Plan was justified as the proposals need not detract from the character of the conservation area or introduce an incongruous element into the area which would adversely affect the character or appearance of the conservation area and the setting of the 'A' Listed St Serfs Church.

Amendment (Councillors Young and Lyall) - Refuse, for the following reasons:

1. **The proposal is contrary to Policy 71 of the Perth Area Local Plan 1995 incorporating Alteration No1 – Housing Land 2000 as it will adversely affect the character of the surrounding area.**
2. **The proposal is contrary to Policy 74 of the Perth Area Local Plan 1995 incorporating Alteration No1 – Housing Land 2000 as it will adversely affect the character and appearance of the Dunning Conservation Area.**
3. **The proposal is contrary to Policy 76 of the Perth Area Local Plan 1995 incorporating Alteration No1 – Housing Land 2000 as it will adversely affect the setting of the Scheduled Ancient Monument St Serfs Church.**

4. The proposal is contrary to Policy 77 of the Perth Area Local Plan 1995 incorporating Alteration No1 – Housing Land 2000 as it will adversely affect the setting of the A Listed St Serfs Church.
5. The proposal is contrary to Historic Scotland’s Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas especially Section 4.35 and Appendix 1 Section 10.0.0 as it introduces an incongruous element into the area which adversely affects the character and appearance of the Conservation Area and the setting of the A Listed St Serfs Church.

Amendment - 8

Motion – 2

Abstention - 1

Resolved:

In accordance with the Amendment.

COUNCILLOR HOWIE LEFT THE MEETING AT THIS POINT.

(7) 06/00839/OUT - GARTH - Erection of dwellinghouse (in outline) at land at Garth, Fortingall, Aberfeldy - Dundas Kerr - Report 06/549.

Mr Paterson, representing the applicant, and Mr Gallagher representing Garth Residents’ Association, addressed the Committee, and following their respective representations, withdrew to the public benches.

Resolved:

Refuse, for the following reasons:

1. The proposal is contrary to the Development Plan i.e. Policy 54 Housing in the Countryside of the Highland Area Local Plan (2000) in that the proposal does not meet any of the categories (a) Building Group (b) Renovation or Replacement (c) Conversions (d) Operational Need (e) Western Highland Perthshire.
2. The proposal is contrary to the Housing in the Countryside Policy (December 2005) in that although considered to fall within part 1 Building Groups, the site does not meet all the specified criteria including that it is not suitably contained to prevent extension into the countryside.
3. The proposed development is likely to result in the loss of trees from the site which is considered to be to the detriment of the residential and visual amenity of the group.

(8) 06/01166/FUL - COMRIE - Alterations and extension to dwellinghouse at 4 Bobs Yard, Dalginross, Comrie, Crieff - Ms S Loxley - Report 06/550.

Resolved:

Refuse, for the following reasons:

1. In the interests of visual amenity, the proposed extension by reason of its bulk and design would detract from the appearance of the existing modest single storey dwelling, resulting in an unbalanced and unsympathetic extension, out of scale and out of keeping with the character and appearance of the existing dwellinghouse and surrounding area. Approval would therefore be contrary to Policies 2, 5 & 74 of the Strathearn Area Local Plan 2001.
2. The proposals as submitted would result in a cramped and over-intensive development of the site and cause the loss of private amenity space, to the extent that the space around the dwellinghouse would be inadequate to serve the purposes of the extended unit, to the detriment of the amenity of the house and surrounding area. Approval of the application would therefore be contrary to the Strathearn Area Local Plan Policies 2, 5 & 74.

- (9) **06/01253/FUL - CRIEFF - Erection of 5 dwellinghouses on land at disused bowling green and 42 Mitchell Street, Crieff - Strathardle Developments Ltd - Report 06/551.**

Resolved:

Defer, to enable discussions to take place with the applicant on providing an element of affordable housing on the site.

- (10) **06/01291/FUL - FORTINGALL - Erection of 2 dwellinghouses and private access road at land east of Gartbeag House, Fortingall, Aberfeldy - Peter Anderson - Report 06/552.**

Mr Strickland, representing the applicant, followed by Mr Gallagher, representing objectors to the application, addressed the Committee, and following their respective representations, withdrew to the public benches.

Resolved:

Refuse, on the grounds that the proposal is contrary to Highland Area Local Plan (2000) Policy 54 Housing in the Countryside as the proposals did not reflect the existing building pattern at Garth.

- (11) **06/01352/FUL - SCONE - Erection of a dwellinghouse at 11 Lovers Lane, Scone - Mr and Mrs David Mitchell - Report 06/553.**

Ms MacKay, representing the applicant, addressed the Committee, and following her representation, withdrew to the public benches.

Resolved:

Grant, on the grounds that the proposal is not contrary to Policy 71 of the Perth Area Local Plan 1995 as the proposal did not constitute overdevelopment of the site, adversely affect the density, character and amenity of the area or the amenity of existing houses which overlook it.