APPENDIX A

PERTH AND KINROSS COUNCIL

EDUCATION AND CHILDREN'S SERVICES

OPTIONS APPRAISAL REPORT

ST NINIAN'S EPISCOPAL PRIMARY SCHOOL



1. Introduction

The Council's Corporate Plan identifies the vision of 'a confident and ambitious Perth and Kinross with a strong identity and clear outcomes that everyone works together to achieve. Our area will be vibrant and successful; a safe secure and healthy environment; and a place where people and communities are nurtured and supported'.

This strategic approach embraces the vision for our area, our communities and our people as outlined in the Corporate Plan. Our key service priorities support the delivery of our commitments in the Community Planning Partnership's Single Outcome Agreement and Corporate Plan, helping Education and Children's Services to focus on the local outcomes that will achieve meaningful improvements for the area, our local communities and our citizens.

Councils, as Education Authorities, have a statutory duty in terms of the Education (Scotland) Act 1980 to make adequate and efficient provision of school education across their entire area for the current school population and future pattern of demand.

Councils also have a statutory responsibility in terms of the Local Government in Scotland Act 2003 to achieve best value.

The school estate is a significant and valuable asset to the communities of Perth and Kinross. Between 2017 and 2023, the Council will invest £141m in the school estate, including a number of new or replacement primary schools and a substantial upgrade programme for secondary schools. In addition the Scottish Government is funding a new £32.5m secondary school at Bertha Park.

The School Estate Strategy (Report No. 12/370 refers) sets out the Council's aspirations for our schools, and in particular the high value we place on learning, through our vision for well designed, maintained and managed schools. The <u>School Estate Management Plan</u> details how we plan to deliver the strategy.

It is important, in light of the significant investment and cost associated with the school estate, that it is managed in an efficient and effective manner, and that the priorities which are addressed meet the wider strategic objectives of the Council and the needs of our communities.

2 Background

2.1 Transformation

There are significant challenges for managing the school estate over the coming years. These include changing demographics including population growth and movement, house building in certain locations, ongoing deterioration in building infrastructure, pressure on planned maintenance budgets, increasing revenue costs and the expansion of Early Learning and Childcare (ELC).

The Council's Transformation Strategy 2015-2020 'Building Ambition' and Organisational Development Framework were approved by Council on 1 July 2015

(Report No. 15/292 refers). Together they detail how Perth and Kinross Council will deliver transformation over the next five years. Accompanying the strategy is a programme of major reviews which are considered to be key drivers and enablers of transformation across the organisation.

As part of the Council's Transformation Programme 2015-2020, a review of the school estate was approved. On 24 August 2016, the Council approved the report "Transformation – School Estate Review" (Report 16/347 refers). This report proposed principles to be used to prioritise investment and as a basis for a high level review of the school estate. The purpose of the transformation review is to support the delivery of better outcomes for all of our young people through more effective use and management of the school estate.

2.2 Basis of review

The principles approved as a basis for the review are:

- (i) Schools should have an occupancy rate where possible greater than 60% of the capacity and ideally should be operating at between 80% and 100% capacity;
- (ii) Every school should be rated as A or B i.e. at least satisfactory for condition and suitability; and
- (iii) Life expired buildings within the school estate should be prioritised for replacement.

2.3 Inclusion of St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School

On 2 November 2016, the Council approved the report "Securing the Future of the School Estate – Next Steps" (Report 16/485 refers). This report detailed the outcome of the high level review and proposed to proceed with further work on the schools which did not meet the suitability, condition or occupancy principles detailed in 2.2.

It was agreed, in the report above, that an options appraisal should be carried out on St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School due to under-occupancy.

At the School Census¹ 2015, the school had a pupil roll of 63 and, at the same time, an approved capacity of 150 giving an occupancy level of 42%.

2.4 Current Position

The school had a roll of 65 pupils at Census 2017 which is an occupancy of 43% against the official capacity of 150 pupils. This options appraisal will consider the school roll and occupancy.

3. Legislation

The <u>Schools Consultation (Scotland) Act 2010</u> provides a strong, accountable statutory consultation process that local authorities must apply to their handling of all

¹ An annual pupil census in publicly funded schools in Scotland is carried out every year for publication by the Scottish Government. This usually takes place in September. Pupil roll forms part of the census

proposals for school closures and other major changes to schools. These consultation processes are expected to be robust, open, transparent and fair, and seen to be so. They are also expected to be consistent across Scotland.

The Education (Scotland) Act 2016 amends the Standards in Scotland's Schools Act 2000 by adding in new duties to address inequality of outcome. These duties apply in different ways to both Scottish Ministers and education authorities. Where the education authority is making or implementing strategic decisions about school education, it is required to have due regard to the need to carry out its functions in a way which is designed to reduce inequalities of outcome. This is particularly directed in the Act towards pupils who experience those inequalities through socio-economic disadvantage, but there is also a power to extend the range of pupils who are covered by this duty.

In addition, the <u>Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015</u> sets out a new right for community organisations to request the transfer of local assets into local community ownership/management. Public bodies including Councils must consider such requests and respond within a reasonable timescale to them.

3.2 Statutory Guidance

The Statutory Guidance on the Schools Consultation (Scotland) Act 2010 promotes informal consultation or "pre consultation" with communities regarding a proposal before a formal 2010 Act proposal paper is formulated. The Statutory Guidance recommends 'early engagement with the local community' with a view to:

- 'establishing possible alternatives';
- 'information gathering and sharing in advance of a statutory consultation';
- 'engaging and empowering communities to understand and help shape the proposals that affect them'.

Although pre-consultation is a particular feature of the process where the Council is considering the future of rural schools, the Council has decided to use a similar approach to inform options appraisals for all schools which are part of the review.

3.3 Community Engagement and Feedback

Details of the pre-consultation process and feedback are contained in Appendix 1 and are also referred to in relation to individual options. The feedback which is detailed in Appendix 1 has been issued to the Parent Council, Headteacher and St Ninian's Episcopal Cathedral and published on the Council website.

The key themes in the feedback from St Ninian's Primary School were:

- The school is a great school with good staff and a positive ethos;
- Parents chose St Ninian's for the small class sizes, nurture, and level of 1:1 time for the pupils;
- Parents chose St Ninian's because they did not rate their catchment school:
- The school should remain open as closing the school would be detrimental to the pupils;
- Large schools do not suit every child;

- The denominational status of the school should be retained;
- The link with the Cathedral is positive and beneficial to the school;
- Closing the school would be a loss to the church community;
- The school uses all of its space and there is no 'spare' space for extra services to be included in the school;
- Provision of a nursery and after school care would be welcomed;
- Council figures on capacity are incorrect, the capacity is too high;
- The Council needs to promote the school more. The school roll is increasing and will increase more with better advertising.

4. St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School

4.1 Pupil Numbers

The tables below show the historic, current and projected pupil numbers for St Ninian's Primary School.

School Roll Pupil Numbers – Historic Data

(Based on Census)

	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
St Ninian's Capacity	150	150	150	150	150	150	150	150	150
St Ninian's Roll	117	104	96	97	86	86	63	49	65

(Table 1)

Pupil numbers have fallen consistently year on year until 2017/18. As all of the pupils attend on placing requests, it is difficult to ascertain the reasons for the reducing roll. However, the new primary school at St John's (opened 2011) has a significant number of pupils from the Balhousie Primary School catchment area who may previously have attended St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School by placing request. The community and parents at the session were asked to give their views on why they thought the roll was falling and the main feedback was:

- The school was not well publicised by the Council; and
- · Parents choose schools with after school clubs.

School Roll Pupil Numbers - Projected

St Ninian's Capacity	2018/	2019/	2020/	2021/
	2019	2020	2021	2022
	150	150	150	150
St Ninian's Roll	69	75	79	83

(Table 2)

The future roll of St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School has been calculated on the basis of average pupil rolls over recent years. It is not possible to base future rolls on the number of children registered with a General Practitioner (GP) within the

catchment area, as happens with non-denominational catchments, as the catchment of the school covers the whole of Perth and Kinross and all admissions are through placing requests.

4.2 School Capacity.

The current school capacity is 150 pupils. This is based on 6 classes of 25 pupils. A layout of the school is attached as Appendix 2.

The school is the smallest primary school in Perth, based on capacity.

There was a view, through the drop-in sessions and discussion with the Parent Council and Church, that the capacity of the school should have been reduced when works were carried out to demolish an annex building in summer 2016. The annex was used as a nurture class and the nurture class was subsequently accommodated in the main building. The capacity was not reduced when the annex was removed, as if the roll was to rise, all suitable rooms in the school would be used to accommodate the roll.

Consideration will be given to the school capacity as part of this options appraisal.

4.3 Location of School

St. Ninian's Episcopal Primary School is situated at the bottom of Dunkeld Road in the centre of Perth. It is close to St Ninian's Cathedral, which belongs to the Scottish Episcopal Church and is part of the Diocese of St Andrews, Dunkeld and Dunblane.

4.4 Church and School Catchment

St Ninian's Primary School is an Episcopal school and is therefore a denominational school. The Episcopal Church is a Christian Church and is a province of the worldwide Anglican Communion. The catchment of the school is the whole of the Perth and Kinross area. Any child living within the Perth and Kinross Council boundary may apply to attend St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School by submitting a placing request. Baptised Episcopalians are given priority for admission and are entitled to transport to the school if they live further than the statutory walking distance.

St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School is one of 3 Episcopal schools in Scotland.

It should be noted that the Education (Scotland) Act 1980 imposes a statutory duty on all local authorities to provide religious education and religious observance in Scottish schools. Religious and moral education in non-denominational schools and religious education in Roman Catholic schools is a statutory core subject for all pupils attending primary and secondary education. There are specific guidelines for religious education in Roman Catholic schools but not in Episcopal schools.

4.5 Building information

The school was originally located beside St Ninian's Cathedral in North Methven Street under a lease from the St Ninian's Cathedral Chapter from 1936. The lease was terminated in 1978 and the school moved to its present location circa 1978. The

land and the building belong to Perth and Kinross Council. The school was previously the Northern District .There are no title restrictions which would prohibit the Council from selling the site. There is no record of the building, or any part of the building being listed with Historic Scotland.

A survey of the building was carried out in April 2017 to assess the current condition of the building. "Condition" is an assessment of the physical condition of the school and its grounds. The condition of the building is rated 'B' (performing adequately but showing minor deterioration). A further 'desktop' Mechanical and Electrical (M&E) survey was undertaken in November 2017. The condition has not been adjusted to take the M&E survey into account, as the Council along with other Scottish Councils is about to update the means of assessing condition. The works required as a result of the M&E survey have been included in the potential future spend.

"Suitability" is an assessment of the school as a whole, its buildings and its grounds and the impact they have on teaching and learning, leisure and social activities and the health and wellbeing of users. The overall suitability of the building is rated 'B' (performing well but with minor problems). The external social spaces are rated as suitability 'C' (Poor – Showing major problems and/or not operating optimally).

The total spend on maintaining the building over the last 3 years was £317,133. This has been wholly funded by the Council.

Maintenance works to the value of £325,000 will be required in future years. This is primarily for: replacement of radiators and heating pipework, new windows and wiring.

4.6 Financial Information (Staff, Transport and Other)

A financial overview is contained in Appendix 3.

The revenue (or running) cost for financial year 2017/2018 for operating St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School is £291,534. This includes staff and building costs such as energy and cleaning.

The school has advised that they receive £300 per annum from the Episcopal Diocese towards a school trip.

5. Pupils and Families at St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School

5.1 Where they live

Based on the 2017 Census, the vast majority of pupils at St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School live in Perth. Thirty five pupils (54%) attend the school from the catchment areas of Balhousie Primary School (17 pupils) and Inch View Primary School (18 pupils) which are the closest non-denominational primary schools to the St Ninian's location.

5.2 Socio Economic Factors

The Council uses the Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation (SIMD) and ACORN data to understand levels of deprivation across Perth and Kinross and also in individual schools.

Further information on SIMD and ACORN are detailed in Appendix 4.

SIMD quintile 1 represents the most deprived areas.

22% of the pupils attending St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School live in areas which are in Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation (SIMD) quintile 1. This compares against an average of 7% in SIMD quintile 1 across Perth and Kinross.

ACORN 5 represents the most deprived areas.

42% of pupils attending St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School fall into category 5. This compares against an average of 13% across Perth and Kinross.

St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School is in receipt of Pupil Equity Funding (PEF). PEF is being provided as part of the £750m Attainment Scotland Fund which will be invested over the current Parliamentary term to tackle the poverty related attainment gap.

A large number of families of pupils at St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School live in areas which are considered deprived and therefore regard must be given to this when considering the options. This is because the Council has a duty to have regard to the need to reduce inequality of outcome caused by socio economic disadvantage when making strategic decisions about the school estate.

5.3 Religion

St Ninian's Primary School is an Episcopal School. The school was unable to provide information on how many baptised Episcopalians attended the school. At the drop-in community event, one of the parents advised that she had two children who were baptised Episcopalians, other parents advised that they were practicing Episcopalians but that their children were not baptised.

In the 2017 Census, 15% of pupils were described as Christian, 6% other religions, 57% were described as having no religion and the remainder (22%) not disclosed or known.

The St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School handbook describes Religious/Moral Education and Religious Observance as follows:

Religious/Moral Education

The children develop a sense of right and wrong and learn to take responsibility for their actions. This is learned alongside the principles of Christianity and respect for other world religions.

Religious Observance

We have a weekly assembly in the school hall and classes are actively involved in leading these throughout the school session. We invite other religious organisations to come and address the school through assembly.

Services are held in the Cathedral twice a year (Christmas and summer) and parents and friends are always welcome to join us at these times.

We would normally expect all children to participate in religious "education" although not necessarily in religious "observance" (i.e. assemblies).

5.4 Class Sizes

The class composition in recent years at St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School is as follows:

Class	2015/16	Class	2016/17	Class	2017/18
P1/2	16	P1/2	18	P1/2	23
P3/4	15	P3/4/5	16	P3/4	22
P5/6	18	P6/7	15	P5/6/7	20
P7	14				
	63		49		65

(Table 3)

The average class size in Perth and Kinross primary schools is 23 pupils (Census 2017). The maximum class size for composite classes is 25.

6. Impact of Wider School Estate Review

6.1 Potential closure of Balhousie Primary School

The options appraisal for Balhousie Primary School and North Muirton Primary School recommends that consideration is given to the closure of Balhousie Primary School. If that recommendation were to be accepted, it is possible that younger pupils may leave Balhousie Primary School to attend a neighbouring school while the process is still underway, and that new Primary 1s would seek to attend St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School rather than Balhousie Primary School because of its proximity. The roll could therefore increase, although there is no way of knowing whether this will happen.

7. Options for Consideration

A number of options are considered for the future of St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School as part of this options appraisal:

- 1) Do nothing school remains open as a denominational school;
- 2) School remains open Remove denominational status of school and create a new non-denominational catchment area for the school:
- 3) School remains open extend the provision of other Perth & Kinross Council services and utilise space within the school for these services;
- 4) Consider closing school and pupils attend catchment schools.

7.1 Do nothing – school remains open as a denominational school

Community Feedback

This option received the highest number of comments in support, of all of the four options (125). The majority of these comments reflected views on the benefits of attending St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School. Some examples are:

- The school and its staff are treasures. It's a village school in a city setting. The cathedral connection is great. My grandchild loves it here and is thriving.
- Children with learning difficulties, special needs, speech & language would benefit greatly from St Ninian's due to the homely, nurturing, happy atmosphere and receive one to one attention when needed within the (NEST) as this has helped my son.
- St Ninian's is a great school with committed staff, a positive ethos, a safe and structured place of learning for the increasing number of pupils. As a visiting professional, I cannot see why PKC wants to close it.
- I chose to send my daughter to St Ninian's because of her needs. Our catchment school and even other schools in closer proximity did not have the smaller classrooms and the LACK OF CHANGE that some other schools have due to being so large. Closing or even changing the school will be detrimental to many of the children's education and lives!

Pupil Impact

If the school is to remain open without change, there is no impact on pupils.

Travel Arrangements

There is no impact on travel arrangements with this option.

Financial Impact

A financial overview is contained in Appendix 3.

The financial implications of retaining the 'status quo' for the school are a continuation of the current running costs of approximately £291,534 per annum and capital costs for upgrading the building in future years of £325,000.

Assessment of Impact of Option 1

The 'Do Nothing' option will not affect the community, travel arrangements or current pupils. It will retain a 'small', denominational primary school in Perth, which is accessible to all pupils in Perth and Kinross.

The reason for taking forward an options appraisal for St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School was that pupil numbers had been falling consistently over recent years and there was concern over the sustainability of the school. In 2017/18 the P1 intake was 17, taking the roll up to 65, however there is no certainty that the roll will continue to increase. The pupil roll projections (table 2) reflect that there is no evidence to suggest that the roll will significantly increase. It has not been possible to identify other steps which could increase the roll, whilst maintaining the status quo,

therefore other options which may make the school more sustainable should be considered. This is therefore not considered a reasonable option.

7.2 School remains open – Remove denominational status of school and create a new non-denominational catchment for the school

Community Feedback

The majority of people who attended the drop-in session and responded on-line wanted to retain the denominational status of the school. There were 72 comments in favour of retaining the denominational status.

- To remove our connection with the church would be a very bad idea. The support they offer the school and families is priceless, financially and educationally.
- The school currently accepts pupils from any denomination and catchment area so there is no need to change its denominational status.
- Not big enough for a catchment area.
- No need to remove denominational status as school welcomes children from a variety of backgrounds and faiths already. It is the ethos of the school which matters and this is strengthened by the link between the school and cathedral.

13 comments received, were in agreement with either the removal of the denominational status or a joint denominational/non-denominational catchment.

- Provide the school with a catchment area. With St John's primary and Caledonian Road primary closing, St Ninian's is the last inner city school.
- Why have any religious schools? More inclusive society if we remove all denominational status.
- Why do you need to remove the denominational status of the school? Create a new catchment area for denominational and non-denominational together.

The school community and the church community value the connection between the communities.

As stated previously, the Education (Scotland) Act 1980 imposes a statutory duty on all local authorities to provide religious education and religious observance in Scottish schools. It is normal practice for non-denominational schools to have links to their local churches. Therefore, much of the activity that occurs between the school and St Ninian's Cathedral could continue were the denominational status to be removed.

Pupil Impact

There are few baptised Episcopalians attending the school. The evidence in relation to pupils attending the school is that it is seen as providing access to:

- a school for pupils with 'needs' which families perceive are supported better in a small school environment and;
- a school for families who do not wish pupils to attend their catchment school.

Removal of the denominational status would have the following impact on current and future pupils:

- current pupils would still attend the school;
- the Council would consider transitional arrangement for siblings;
- baptised Episcopalians, who live in Perth and Kinross would not be able to access an Episcopal school in Perth and Kinross, although as part of the process for seeking authority to remove the denominational status, the Council would have to be clear about what the plans were for religious instruction to be provided in another way for denominational pupils.

Removal of the denominational status may have the following impact on pupils:

- School roll may be more stable as a result of having a non-denominational catchment area and not relying on placing requests. There may be an increase in pupil numbers, depending on the catchment area;
- Inch View Primary School roll would reduce if part of its catchment formed the new catchment for St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School;
- Pupils who are perceived to be supported by attending a smaller school may not be able to be accommodated in St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School through placing request due to catchment pupils having priority.

Financial Impact

A financial overview is contained in Appendix 3.

If the pupil roll were to increase, it is possible the running costs would increase, especially if additional staff were required. The cost per child is likely to be less however.

The capital costs for upgrading the building in future years of £325,000 would still be required, however the building would be used more efficiently.

There would be a loss of £300 per annum which, the school have advised the Episcopal Church provides towards a school trip.

Proposed Catchment

A mapping analysis of pupil addresses has been carried out to identify whether a sustainable non-denominational catchment could be created for St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School. It is possible that with a local catchment area, the pupil numbers would increase and the building would therefore be used more efficiently.

The school is situated within the catchment area for Balhousie Primary School and is close to the catchment boundary for Inch View Primary School.

The analysis of pupil addresses has been developed on the basis of a school with capacity for 125 pupils i.e. taking into account the accommodation of the nurture class in the main school building.

The analysis (and maps) of potential catchments is detailed in Appendix 5. The outcome of this analysis is as follows:

Catchment Description	Outcome
South Balhousie Primary School (yellow in Appendix 5)	The school is presently located in this part of the catchment area of Balhousie Primary School. Future under 5's projections indicate adopting this as a catchment area would not significantly increase the pupil roll. Balhousie Primary School is currently under-occupied and this change could make Balhousie Primary School unsustainable if it is to remain open. This catchment area for St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School might be advantageous to the pupils living in this area were Balhousie Primary School to be closed, however those pupils could still make placing requests to St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School if it retained its denominational status.
Inch View Primary School closest to St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School (orange in Appendix 5)	Future pupil projections indicate that there would not be significantly more pupils than currently attend St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School based on children under 5 living in the catchment. It could however possibly reduce the roll of Inch View Primary School, although this will reduce in the future when a new school is built at Oudenarde, as pupils from Oudenarde currently attend Inch View Primary School.
South Balhousie Primary School and Inch View Primary School closest to St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School (yellow + orange in Appendix 5)	Combining these possible catchments may result in pupil numbers in the catchment exceeding the capacity of St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School (125).
Inch View Primary School wider catchment (orange and blue in Appendix 5)	Combining these possible catchments may result in pupil numbers in the catchment exceeding the capacity of St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School (125).

(Table 4)

Assessment of Impact of Option 2

Potential new catchment areas for St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School have been assessed. These catchments have been 'created' based on where pupils currently live and taking into account features such as major streets which naturally separate areas.

New catchment areas have been looked at individually and also as larger combined catchments. If catchments were to be combined the school capacity, assumed to be 125, is likely to be exceeded.

None of the catchments would appear to increase the pupil roll sufficiently in their own right to make St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School more sustainable as a non-denominational school with its own catchment. There would be potential advantages

for Inch View Primary School if its catchment boundary were redrawn to allow more pupils to attend St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School. Occupancy at Inch View Primary School will be dealt with through the construction of a new school at Oudenarde in due course. If Balhousie Primary School were to close then creating a catchment for St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School which included the area on the south side of Balhousie Primary School catchment area would enable pupils to access another school nearby. However, those pupils can currently make a placing request to attend St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School. If St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School retains its denominational status, this would continue to be the case.

The denominational status of the school is valued by the community and as it has a Perth and Kinross wide catchment and there are small numbers of baptised Episcopalians attending the school, it allows pupils who live close to the school to attend through placing request.

Whilst creating a catchment may lead to a more stable roll, none of the workable options would lead to a significant increase in the projected roll, or significantly relieve any occupancy issues for neighbouring schools. It is therefore considered that the benefits of providing a catchment area do not outweigh the negatives of removing the denominational status of the school. Therefore, it not considered reasonable to pursue this option further as part of the review.

7.3 School remains open – extend the provision of other Perth & Kinross Council services and utilise space within the school for these services

Education and Children's Services (ECS) has accommodation pressures as a result of the expansion of Early Learning and Childcare (ELC) from 600 hours to 1140 hours per annum for all 3 and 4 year olds and eligible 2 year olds. The Council would like to use existing assets where possible to accommodate this expansion. St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School could provide accommodation for up to 24 nursery pupils with adaptations to the building, and by reducing the capacity of the school.

The Gaelic community have suggested that St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School would be a suitable location for Gaelic Medium Education (GME) which is currently located at Goodlyburn Primary School. The Gaelic Language Plan has recently been approved by the Council and work will progress separately in line with the actions set out in the plan.

Establishing a nursery class would make the best use of space in St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School, whilst also supporting the expansion of ELC. It should be noted that nurseries are non-denominational.

Community Feedback

Almost 60% of comments on this option were supportive (28 comments in all).

• Option 3. Please ensure the other council services are within E & Cs! Within such an option, the existing denominational school and other uses will fit comfortably. Specialisms in 1-1 education/art/music/gaelic? All good. In this

- age of ENFORCED budget austerity it is necessary to be creative and accept compromise for the better good of all, including the denominational school.
- This is a really good alternative and would offer so much opportunity for the community to see what a fantastic school St Ninian's is.
- I think a nursery would be good in the school, even a small 20/20 run nursery, would then help boost numbers for the intake in primary one.
- Ok as long as no impact on current pupils activities on offer.

There were 19 comments against this option, a number of them relating to maintaining the level of space that the school enjoys currently.

- Where? We currently have 1 classroom which is 'free'! This is used for music, drama and visiting specialists. This is also used for meetings in school, we have no other suitable space.
- So let other people and strangers into a primary? No thanks.
- The council have ample provision and spaces elsewhere for them to use. The school would NOT BENEFIT from this decision.

Pupil Impact

Nursery children would benefit from a transition to P1 in a familiar environment.

Changes would be required to the building to accommodate a nursery. Three rooms are being used as classrooms in the school. There is a 4th classroom, a Learning Resource Centre (LRC) and nurture room. There is also a small group room and activity room. The school has a hall which is used for dining and PE. The school also has a large staffroom and 2 offices.

The school has enjoyed the use of additional space over the last few years because of the decreasing roll, and parents are keen to retain this position. There are Scottish Government <u>space guidelines for primary schools</u> and generally a primary school of this size would have one 'general purpose' (GP) space which could be the dining/PE space. As detailed above, St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School have a number of GP spaces in addition to their hall used for dining/PE.

The Council would work with the school to incorporate a nursery into the school in a way which will support teaching and learning and retain as many facilities as possible. Specifically, there is a commitment to retain the nurture base.

Financial Impact

A financial overview is contained in Appendix 3.

The staff costs would increase if there is nursery provision, however the Scottish Government (SG) will fund the implementation of 1140 hours for ELC.

SG will also be contributing towards the redevelopment of the building for nursery provision, which fully will be costed when plans are developed.

The capital costs for upgrading the building in future years of £325,000 would still be required, however the building would be used more efficiently.

Assessment of Impact – Option 3

This option would retain the denominational status of the school, allowing local pupils and Episcopalians to attend. Current pupils would continue their education at the school.

The option would support the Council's requirement to deliver the expansion of Early Learning and Childcare (ELC) through provision of a non-denominational nursery.

The introduction of a nursery would improve the transition from nursery to primary for children attending nursery at the school. It is also likely to boost or at least stabilise the school roll as children commonly continue into P1 within the school where they attend nursery. It should be noted that parents of nursery children would still have to be make placing requests for the primary school.

This option would also support the objective to reduce inequality of outcome through providing access to local nursery education in an area of socio economic deprivation.

The creation of a nursery class would result in the space within the school being used more efficiently, in line with Scottish Government guidelines.

This is considered a reasonable option, as it: supports ELC which is one of the key strategic objectives of the Council; promotes sustainable pupil numbers; uses the school building more effectively therefore providing better value for money in terms of capital spend and running costs and; would support the reduction of inequality of outcome through providing a local nursery in a socio economically deprived area.

It should be noted that the nursery will be subject to Care Inspectorate approval.

7.4 Consider closing school and pupils attend catchment schools

Analysis of the pupil numbers show that as the pupils come from a wide range of catchment schools it would be possible to close the school without generally impacting significantly on pupil rolls in other schools.

Community Feedback

Almost 99% of those who responded were against this option.

- The closure of the school would be a severe loss in terms of nurture and educational attainments. Children can be welcomed from across the PKC area, giving an option to parents not offered by any other school.
- I would be very sad to see this excellent school close. It has a very warm, stimulating learning environment. The children obviously benefit from smaller classes.
- Closing the school would be a huge loss to the local community.
- Option4 disaster! Other schools also being reviewed children may have to travel further resulting in traffic congestion and environmental impact. Loss of inner city denominational school. Building risks becoming another Perth derelict.

Pupil Impact

If this option was implemented, pupils would be required to attend their catchment school or another school through placing request. There would be the following impact on pupils;

- current pupils would have to transition to a new school;
- the catchment school may be further away than St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School resulting in increased travel distance to school for existing pupils; and
- baptised Episcopalians, who live in Perth and Kinross would not be able to access an Episcopal school in Perth and Kinross.

Financial Impact

A financial overview is contained in Appendix 3.

The annual savings generated from closing St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School amount to approximately £196,455 annually. This is predominately made up of staff and building costs.

If the building were sold a capital receipt would be forthcoming and the capital cost of upgrading the building of £325,000 would not be required.

Assessment of Impact - Option 4

This is the most financially advantageous option with savings of approximately £196,455 annually and no requirement to upgrade the property at a cost of £325,000.

However, Option 3 will avoid the need for pupils to move school and enable the school to be retained as a denominational school, in an area where there is also socio economic disadvantage. It would also support the expansion of Early Learning and Childcare through establishing a nursery class, all of which will make the school more efficient in financial terms. The advantages of Option 3 are considered to be greater on balance than those of Option 4. It is therefore not considered reasonable to pursue Option 4 further as part of this review.

7.5 Overview of Options

The outcome of the high level options appraisal is summarised below:

	Option Description	Outcome
Option 1	Do nothing – school to remain open without change	Rejected.
		Not a
		reasonable
		option
Option 2	School remains open – Remove denominational	Rejected.
	status of school and create a new non-	Not a
	denominational catchment for the school	reasonable
		option

Option 3	School remains open – extend the provision of other Perth & Kinross Council services and utilise space within the school for these services	Accepted as a reasonable option
Option 4	Consider closing school and pupils attend catchment schools	Rejected. Not a reasonable option

(Table 5):

The outcome of the option appraisal recommends Option 3 – School remains open – extend the provision of other Perth & Kinross Council services and utilise space within the school for these services.

8. Detailed Analysis of Reasonable Option: School remains open – extend the provision of other Perth & Kinross Council services and utilise space within the school for these services

8.1 Pupil Impact

There would be some re-development of the school's internal layout to accommodate a nursery class. Any redevelopment would retain the NEST facility which is used for nurture.

With the introduction of a nursery, the maximum capacity of the school will be reduced. Approximately 24 places would be available for nursery pupils, however these are not included in the school capacity which is why the capacity of the school would need to be reduced.

8.2 Educational Benefits

Educational Benefit Statement

This Educational Benefits Statement is written from the perspective of benefits, should the preferred option outlined in the options appraisal subsequently be implemented.

Learning and Teaching

If the recommended option is progressed, pupils will continue to have the opportunity to work in groups, at peer level and across all stages in the school and in mixed sex groups. This allows the sharing of ideas, peer support, informal mentoring and relationship building, all of which contribute to the whole school experience for all pupils.

The introduction of an on-site nursery class will allow the opportunity for future pupils to have access to early years provision within the setting of the school, allowing for seamless transition to P1, with pupils already familiar with the physical setting, should their placing requests for admission to P1 to the school be approved.

Currently there are additional support staff, who are delivering interventions to targeted pupils, as well as literacy resources and a reading scheme.

Environment for Learning

The current school grounds, which were recently extended by the removal of life expired buildings, will continue to provide facilities for external learning and play.

The school currently benefits by being accessible for children and adults with Additional Support Needs and this will continue. The school is on one level, with ramped access to the building and accessible toilet provision. There is currently a nurture class and provision of consultancy led support from a Pupil Support Teacher, allowing group work to take place if required, which not only benefits pupils with ASN, but all other pupils, who can work in these groups, and benefit from short term support.

Experiences and Opportunities

The introduction of an on-site nursery class allows both the nursery and primary pupils to widen their social and emotional experiences through working together in a safe and secure environment. There are opportunities for buddying programmes, reading and play sessions and working together across the school, promoting increased confidence at all ages, and fostering responsibility in the elder pupils.

Summary of Educational Benefits

Learning and teaching at St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School in P1-7 would continue as it is. The addition of early years education will widen the opportunities for all children in terms of shared and new experiences. Older children would benefit from the interaction and responsibilities in working with and mentoring younger pupils, and the nursery children would benefit from the seamless transition to P1, with the familiarity and shared resources easing their transition into formal education.

8.3 Impact on Travel Arrangements & Environmental Impact

There is currently no transport provided for pupils attending St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School. Transport is only provided for Episcopalian pupils who travel more than 2 miles to St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School. There would be a positive impact for parents of nursery children, who may not have to travel so far to nursery. Less travel will have a positive environmental impact.

8.4 Community Impact

This option will maintain links with the Church, Perth and Kinross Association of Voluntary Service (PKAVS) and neighbours.

8.5 Financial Impact

There would be capital costs involved with the re-development of the school layout to incorporate a nursery class. Staff costs will also increase due to employing nursery staff. It is likely that these costs will be met by the Scottish Government in order that the Council can deliver the expansion of ELC.

Current building running costs and the future capital development costs will remain as they are, however they will be used to benefit more children.

8.6 Socio-Economic Impact

This option would also support the objective to reduce inequality of outcome through providing access to more nursery education in an area of socio economic deprivation.

9. Conclusion

St Ninian's Episcopal Primary was included in the School Estate Transformation Project as a result of the occupancy of the school being 43% as at Census 2015.

Four options have been reviewed in considering the future of St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School.

Information was collated on pupil numbers, housebuilding, finances, the school, pupils and families, socio economic factors, travel arrangements, environmental impact and the local area and community to inform the options.

As part of the review, a pre-consultation exercise was carried out with the local community.

Each of the options was then considered and the outcome determined as follows:

	Option Description	Outcome
Option 1	Do nothing – school to remain open without change	Rejected. Not a reasonable option, at this time, due to the continued uncertainty over the school roll.
Option 2	School remains open – Remove denominational status of school and create a new non-denominational catchment for the school	Rejected. Not a reasonable option, at this time, due to the benefits of creating a non-denominational catchment not being significant enough to justify the change.
Option 3	School remains open – extend the provision of other Perth & Kinross Council services and utilise space within the school for these services	Accepted as a reasonable option, at this time, due to the benefits for the school, meeting the strategic aims of the Council in relation to Early Learning and Childcare and leading to more efficient use of the school.
Option 4	Consider closing school and pupils attend catchment schools	Rejected. Not a reasonable option at this time, as Option 3 can deliver benefits with fewer disadvantages.

The option which was considered to be reasonable was then considered in more detail, including considering the factors of travel arrangements, community impact and educational benefits.

The option which was considered reasonable was school remains open – extend the provision of other Perth & Kinross Council services and utilise space within the school for these services. This option would enable the creation of a nursery class within the school.

In summary, it is proposed that the capacity of the school is reduced and a nursery class is created following a re-development of the internal school layout.

Community Engagement

Website and On-line Questionnaires

A 'School Estate Transformation' page was set up on the Perth and Kinross Council website which provided the wider community with an overview of information that the Council would be using in the options appraisal, including pupil projections and building information.

A questionnaire was also available for completion, for those people that could not attend the community engagement events. The questionnaire asked people to respond to a series of options and questions related to the options appraisal.

The questionnaire was available on the Council website from 16 August 2017 to 6 October 2017. 49 questionnaires were submitted of which 19 stated a preferred option.

Drop-In Session

A community drop-in session was held at the school on Wednesday 30 August 2017 from 3pm to 7pm to seek feedback from the community on the future of St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School. 109 people signed in to the meeting. 40% of the attendees identified themselves as parents, 25% as the church congregation, 10% as other family members, 10% as staff, 1% as neighbours and 14% as others.

The Council is grateful to the Parent Council and St Ninian's Cathedral for their assistance in the planning and publicity for the drop-in session.

Content of Sessions

Visitors to the events were given an overview of information that the Council would be using in this options appraisal, including pupil projections and building and financial information. They were asked to:

- give feedback on each of the options being considered in the options appraisal either through using post-it notes or through filling in a questionnaire
- respond to a couple of additional questions related to the reducing roll of the school and the reasons for choosing the school

St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School

Community Drop-In Session

30 August 2017

Overview of comments received at Community drop-in session and Online Questionnaires

Online Questionnaire Feedback

- 49 Questionnaires submitted online 18 completed, 31 partially completed
- 43% (13) of responses from parents, 23% (7) of responses from the wider community, 17% (5) of responses from the Church, 7% (2) of responses from other family members, 7% (2) of responses from 'other' and 3% (1) of responses from neighbours. 19 had given no indication of the relationship to the school
- 35 questionnaires were submitted without any comments
- 42% (8) of responses preferred option 1, 32% (6) of responses preferred option 2, 21% (4) of responses preferred option 3 and 5% (1) preferred option 4. Responses from 30 questionnaires gave no indication of their preference.
- Questionnaire closed on 6 October 2017

Online Questionnaire Feedback

Option 1 – Do nothing

- Some pupils work better in smaller schools and closing schools removes the
 option of them being able to attend a school with a more one on one
 environment. The only reason the school role has dropped is due to change in
 Catholic school offering.
- Brilliant school. Daughter loves it. She is being stretched and challenged and brought on in every area of the curriculum. She is bright and they are able to push her on without pressure. They have innovative teaching. The school uses all community resources including local park, sports and cathedral. So community respect of all ages and cultures and faiths a strong theme. Teachers are very supportive despite huge pressure's small size and therefore few resources compared to larger schools. I would worry other classes would remove essential facets of the school e.g. nurture space that would mean teaching standards reduce and that affects my child's educational attainment. Losing the cathedral would remove a significant resource and support for community working. A catchment would not increase the role. Better advertising and support from council during placing request process needed.

- This school is great for children who would struggle with a bigger school my son was very shy when he was at nursery and took a long time to talk to staff if he had went to a large school he would have hidden in a corner and I am fairly sure he would go unnoticed in this school he is thriving.
- By Law we have a right to remain Denominational. Don't see the Council closing Catholic School? It was the Council that bull-dozed 2 classrooms and changed another couple to offices without seeking our Cathedral approval.
 This is a brilliantly run School with top class care for its 69 pupils and growing.
- Option 1 is the only option although it is very negative thing to put on the list.
 Why couldn't it have said leave the school running as it is? The school is
 busier than you think. The kids there are benefitting from a smaller community
 that in bigger schools they would get spat up and chewed out. There is a
 strong sense of family and a very nurturing environment for our kids. Don't
 underestimate the power of word of mouth and current coverage to increase
 numbers further.
- I like the fact it's a small school, my daughter has a short attention span and
 also sensory issues so my choice to send her to this schoolers on the simple
 fact it was a nice small school, there for would make it easier being in a small
 class better for her to learn and not get distracted to easily and more one on
 one time as there is less pupils so there's more help for the pupils
- Leave it alone.
- Yes leave it well alone!!!

Online Questionnaire Feedback

Option 2: School remains open – remove denominational status of school and create a new non-denominational catchment for the school.

- Because it is better to keep the school open and allow others to come to school. Do not want the council selling off for little and get turned into private housing.
- I would like to send my children to this school as it is close to my home, however I am non-religious.
- St. Ninian's Cathedral have put a lot of work to get the school involved with the cathedral, how that would be wasted if this lovely school was to close.
- Totally against our ethos and good educational practice.
- Don't you think it would be very damaging for the community and city of Perth if you were to take the school away from the cathedral and vice versa. Think of the uproar. The cathedral and the wider community is very valuable in these days for both kids and parents alike. Taking away the denominational status because no kids are Episcopalian well may be not all of them are but the cathedral welcomes all faith and I for one very much enjoy the support and family feel of this that we would simply not get anywhere else and I know

- I am not the only parent that feels like this. The school is simply not big enough for a catchment.
- The school although small is an excellent school. In particular the link with the church should not be severed because of the valuable input of the clergy to the children's education practically, morally and spiritually.

Online Questionnaire Feedback

Option 3: School remains open – extend the provision of other Perth & Kinross Council services and utilise space within the school for these services.

Comments

- Housing other services within the school would allow the school the option to expand and increase the roll if demand increased again.
- I would much prefer to do nothing!! But I think it is a shame to have rooms sitting empty when I am sure other PKC services could use this space, my only concern would be other service users would need to use a separate entrance and exit and the costs that may be incurred if renovations or modification were required.
- As the church Diocesan Children and Youth officer it is important to me that
 the school keeps its Episcopalian identity as it is only one of three left in the
 whole of Scotland. Think putting other council services in the school is a good
 idea.
- Classes being disrupted and essential nurture provision would be lost. There
 is not vast spare space as the council figures suggest and they must be
 updated to make this evaluation fair.
- Extending provision, really where, except using it at night or weekends or during holidays it is not as empty as you seem to think but you already have been put right on the figures.

Online Questionnaire Feedback

Option 4: Consider closing school and pupils attend catchment schools.

Comments

 I would be very sad to see this excellent school close. It has a very warm, stimulating learning environment. The children obviously benefit from smaller classes.

Online Questionnaire Feedback

Are there any other options that you would like to propose for the school?

- Advertising the option of attending this school to pre-primary children within the locality as an option for them.
- Is it feasible to 'merge' some of the smaller schools?
- Better placement advice for oversubscribed schools and better website support. Currently school significantly discriminated against as council website unclear in its description and is placed under all high school options when searching by postcode. Glowsite government website for schools not fit for purpose. Financially support for a decent site.
- Put Balhousie and St Ninian's together but keep the Episcopalian identity.
- Are the council looking at the smaller schools in the outlying areas of the Authority? As there are many with small numbers of pupils.
- I really want to question why the head teacher was not allowed in to the meeting at the school. Particularly when the councils figures are incorrect, the school has an additional 20 pupils from last year, also why was I told that keeping the school as it is isn't an option? Giving the impression a decision has been made. And do the council really feel it is a good idea to take the nurture class away and use the dining room as a class room just to be able to expand on numbers? This is a great school and we choose for our kids to come here because they get whatever support they need.
- There are Deeds by Law stating the now St. Ninian's School was given to the Cathedral because the Council sought a Compulsory purchase order due to the fact it wanted the old school for housing and land. The very fact that is written in statute make P&K responsible for a Law Suit should they try and close this school.
- Finally there is a reason why the kids at St Ninian's are not at their catchment schools. Have you thought about that? It is a wee gem of a school that has a very nurturing and caring environment for the kids from all backgrounds not just closing the gap kids. It has given us parents an alternative option that gives our kids the best education and socialisation for them.
- I expect that lots of ideas about after school clubs or holiday clubs would be an option. Also a nursery so that younger siblings could benefit from the early years pre schooling. Though since outbuildings were demolished last year where would these classes go?
- Our children are part of Gaelic Medium Education Unit at Goodlyburn Primary School. Whilst we are very happy to be part of Goodlyburn our overall long-term aim is to expand and grow GME in the Perth area in accordance with the Councils own Gaelic Language Plan. We have been growing slowly but steadily over the last few years and are now reaching our capacity to stay as part of Goodlyburn. We thought that if our expanding Unit would move into St Ninian's primary school it could perhaps turn out to be a win-win for existing St Ninian's pupils and GME pupils alike. Both St Ninian's and the Gaelic Medium unit not have a geographic catchment area, so to GME parents it makes sense to have a joint campus and we view it as an opportunity to:

- Generate significant cost savings for the Council with a combined primary school;
- Use the Scottish Governments Gaelic Schools Capital Fund to re-furbish St Ninian's to make it fit for purpose;
- Have more space to allow GME to grow in a central location in Perth
- And help current St Ninian's parents and pupils so the school can remain open.

Questionnaires were also provided at the drop-in session, the feedback is as follows:

Option 1 – Do nothing

- Because this school has done great with my kids. I did have one kid in a
 catchment area but took her out to come here. If we wanted to use our
 catchment area schools we would but we want this school. Don't be silly and
 take it away.
- The school is performing well. My daughter is thriving. The numbers are rising. Love the connection with the Cathedral. Don't want to go to catchment school. No room for other facilities all rooms used despite Council figures say.
- Children from other counties are welcome here and because there are several
 of them they don't feel different. I meet many parents bringing their children
 here each primary. Many ethnic backgrounds and all very much accepted at
 the school. Which is good for them and the other children. I don't think many
 of them come to the Cathedral on Sundays but this doesn't matter it is one
 of the ongoing involvement in the area of the Cathedral.
- That the school seems to be thriving. The position of school seems ideal in centre of city. That attachment to Cathedral is an opportunity, not disadvantage – it adds variety and philosophy/questioning to young minds. Garden etc important in a city.
- A great school like a village school in a city location. Keeps the centre of the city alive. Episcopalian connection enhances the school in lots of ways. I am Episcopalian, and would like my grandchildren to know of the Christian faith even if they do not adopt it.
- The school for the time I have worked at PKAVS has been a great local partner for us. The teachers and kids regularly visit the day centre to come together with music, theatre and gardening. The teachers and kids being local mean we can share learning and come together easily on a regular basis. We come over at various times throughout the year to join in with other school events.
- We work with the children, our day services have been close with the school for over 10 years and we would hate to lose this.

- The school is the exact size for pupil quality not quantity. It is involved in lots of community links.
- If it stays open it could flourish. There may be more or less children coming
 here from the area but it will still be growing educationally for the children
 currently here and for future pupils. I have been here to fundraising coffee
 mornings where the children have been delightful and I have always felt it is a
 very happy school for both pupils and staff.
- The children I care for from the school appear to be happy and nurtured within their school environment. The wider network of parents and teachers are welcoming and friendly. When I pick the children up from school they are very positive about their day and their learning.
- Many children are settled here. It gives fantastic support. And many parents have chosen this school for that reason. It has no catchment so offers support to everyone and more focus should/could be put aiming to get more kids here.
- My kids have been coming here since 2008 this school has been nothing but amazing and supportive to my children and the teachers are fantastic – no reason to close the school at all.
- Parent has worked at this school for 25 years and has seen many changes and classes.
- The children benefit greatly from the support and community with the cathedral. Need to be promoting the school. Vulnerable families and children better supported in a smaller environment. More than 50% of the pupils have ASN.
- Do nothing is the only logical option.
- As a working With this school for 5 years I have seen the strength of community work within the school and its links and activities with the wider community, local Cathedral and PKAVS. The nurture within the school is such that we have seen children with problems in their early days blossom into strong and confident individuals with clear standards of behaviour and in their attitudes to others.
- St Ninian's is a lovely school exactly the way it is, pupils feel safe, welcomed and happy to come to this school. I believe closing a building that is in good order shouldn't need to be closed when they're other schools with unsafe buildings for pupils. I am completely against closure as it works well with living nearby and for work.
- Supportive staff, excellent education, 1-on-1 time, time at the church, daughter goes to nest has helped her loads. Why fix something if it aint broken.
- This is a great school. Teachers are brilliant; my daughter attends the nest daily. This is extra support for her which since she started has benefited her amazingly. It also gives support to us knowing she is in good hands. The small classes mean more 1:1 support in classes. My son can be very shy so

- knowing he can get extra help without having a large class to compete against makes me happy. Small classes mean more help.
- First the teachers are brilliant and friendly; pupils learn a lot not just the usual schooling but togetherness for each other. As a gran, my grandchildren are becoming well adapted for going forward to bigger and a brighter schooling.
- Cannot see the other options working.
- Wonderful small, supportive nurturing school, excellent teaching staff and friendly environment.
- It's a fantastic school that works well for our Granddaughter; it is offering a solid primary experience in a warm, nurturing environment. Small class sizes mean more one-one contact. The flexibility of current rooms allows extra support to be provided on site. A 'village school' in the city unique!!
- "Doing nothing" seems a strange way to describe option for a school. I
 suspect that plenty goes on and current school is open-minded. Other options
 seem to involve spending more money.
- This school has a great ethos at its core and does sterling work in equipping
 its pupils with life skills as well as an education. It should be supported and
 promoted by PKC.
- The fact that parents choose this school means that they have a huge vested interest in the welfare of the school community.
- 1. Size, suitable for young. 2 position suitable for parents to drop off children on way to work. 3 reputation very good, a very good start to for the young
- The school has and is playing an important role within a vibrant community, with many connections within the centre of Perth. With a committed staff under the headship of a caring HT it is so much a part of the outward reach to community and should be allowed to continue this important mission
- This school has a very important place in the community. Because it has small numbers it can be available to all the children.
- School is fine size. Pupil- teacher relationships are excellent. Tuition levels are excellent.
- I feel St Ninian's has provided a fantastic level of education for my children. They have achieved 1st class honours degrees at university. Due I feel very much to their primary education.
- As a former pupil at this school, my education and career following uni were achieved due to the small class sizes and inclusive education I received.
 Small class sizes benefit pupils far more.
- The Council voluntary purchased old St Ninian's School at Cathedral for land purposes and assured legal purchase of this school!
- Do nothing. I am happy that my son is getting space to grow in this school. My son loves the school environment. The strength of the student help to get more attention to the student as individual.
- Now is not the time for change: Perth population growing: inner city school great for the community and link with Cathedral is priority. Episcopalian

church is not sectarian and is inclusive. Closing a school can damage neighbourhood – the Cathedral is central to North Methven Street and part of the city. Perth needs to stay positive. Weeping window and Salute to Perth have brought thousands to this part of the city – our Episcopalian heritage is an indelible part of Perth's culture. The school roll is growing just now.

- Since the classrooms are smaller the teaching has individual attention on kids. This was the primary reason I sent my daughter to school and she thoroughly enjoyed going to this school. Status quo may be maintained please
- It continues to be a most successful and happy school. Many of my friends at the Cathedral were pupils at the school many years ago and proud of it.
- To do nothing would mean no further support on increased involvement and investment by PKC.

Questionnaires were also provided at the drop-in session, the feedback is as follows:

Option 2: School remains open – remove denominational status of school and create a new non-denominational catchment for the school.

- Opening the catchment area will give the school the chance to gain the extra pupils it needs.
- With opening the catchment area, will allow more pupils to attend this school.
- With opening the catchment area it gives other families a wider area the option to put their children to this school.
- Removing the denominational title of the school would affect pupil roll. Many pupils look at school quality not religious affiliation.
- Provide the school with a catchment area. With St John's primary and Caledonian Road primary closing, St Ninian's is the last inner city school.
- I would support option 2 to have a catchment area, but would like links with the catchment to remain as this promotes engagement with the wider community.
- Do not cut the school off from the church by making it non-denominational.
- Option 2 is detrimental for children as they benefit from garden space, use of Church for festivals and for citizenship.
- Not big enough for a catchment area.
- No need to remove denominational status as school welcomes children from a variety of backgrounds and faiths already. It is the ethos of the school which matters and this is strengthened by the link between the school and cathedral.
- Would be very upset even quite angry if links with cathedral removed.
- Current link with St Ninian's Cathedral is a positive and unique element of education for pupils (social, cultural, religious).
- Keep the school (St Ninian's Primary) open and its denominational status.

- I believe the school's ties with the cathedral are beneficial to the school as a whole.
- My children have been to a large school and were very in on themselves shy
 hard to communicate with other pupils and teachers. They have made very
 much progress in the few weeks they have been here.
- Under the present teaching regime the school have achieved an excellent rapport and contact to and within the surrounding community. Unfortunately the PC brigade has had issues within the denominational aspect of the school when in fact the school is open to all for educational purposes. Need more children into a achieving option.
- St Ninian's Primary School has important links with the values of a Christian Community and as such should be kept and promoted. It is excellent means of introducing an open-mindedness to all faiths.
- Removing denominational status will Not help the school what evidence is there for religion and denial of 'soft' Christian values? Episcopalianism is not hastily prescriptive or exclusive: it's welcoming.
- 2 and 4 are both BAD options to be avoided.
- I see no point in considering any of the other options. Removing the denominational status smacks of political correctness. Parents and prospective pupils are not banned from admission if they are not members of the Scottish Episcopalian Church.
- I oppose the loss of denominational status, since it is its Christian foundations which gives the school its ethos.

Questionnaires were also provided at the drop-in session, the feedback is as follows:

Option 3: School remains open – extend the provision of other Perth & Kinross Council services and utilise space within the school for these services.

- I feel that opening up the school and making numbers bigger would spoil the overall atmosphere and ethos at the school. If numbers are increased the children's quality of learning would be affected.
- School has no 'spare' classrooms and space is limited.
- Option 3 would deprive children of music/drama/nurturing space which would be detrimental to educational attainment.
- The only spare room is used for drama, music and violin practise.
- The option to use space elsewhere for other uses is an option to me; no other option would be, as long as it worked well with the school. For example using building after school hours.
- Using rooms for other things has merit if it does not take away rooms for teaching. As the numbers go up the full capacity of rooms will be needed.

- What 'other services' would school be used for. Lack of specificity in description is misleading.
- More pupils with diversity can only be for the good of school pupils and teachers.
- Provision of a nursery and after school club would strengthen the desirability of choosing St Ninian's.
- 3 might allow financial earnings and facility.
- I think the school would lose its individuality. It has a reputation for helping children with difficulties.

Questionnaires were also provided at the drop-in session, the feedback is as follows:

Option 4: Consider closing school and pupils attend catchment schools.

- Closing the school would mean more classes in bigger schools. Less 1:1 time
 with teachers. Teachers would have less time with children who may struggle
 and need that extra bit of help.
- Closure would be a disaster for current pupils and deny families the choice to send pupils here.
- Closing the school would be a huge loss to the local community.
- Closing the school will be a massive mistake.
- Shutting the school indefinite would be a mistake.
- Shutting schools should not be an option. Education is important. Helps to have places to learn.
- It would be a great loss if this school closed. It has an excellent record. It has close links to the Cathedral and PKAV's. The children are happy and successful. It is also well situated for families living locally.
- Option 4 disaster! Other schools also being reviewed children may have to travel further resulting in traffic congestion and environmental impact. Loss of inner city denominational school. Building risks becoming another Perth derelict.
- Shutting the school will be very hard for me to pick a school that provides the best for my son, he loves this school and I do as well it would be very emotional for a lot of people involved.
- If you close this school you are not thinking about the children that come here. Don't even see why you have picked this school to do this to leave it alone!!!!
- The thought of closing a school that will affect so many children is terrible.
- Absolute rubbish boils down to money. Anyone agreeing with closing down the school I hope you can't sleep at night.
- The school roll should not determine alone whether the school is earmarked for closure.

• The closure of the school would be a severe loss in terms of nurture and educational attainments. Children can be welcomed from across the PKC area, giving an option to parents not offered by any other school.

Questionnaires were also provided at the drop-in session, the feedback is as follows:

Are there any other options that you would like to propose for the school?

- Another teacher would be great as there is not many/if any spaces left in each classroom. Another teacher so composite classes can be smaller as there is a huge range of ability in each class. A lot of pressure for the school staff to meet their pupil's increasing needs and getting it right for each child.
- Possibly a nursery to get numbers up but where would it go? After school club but cost?
- Nursery opening.
- I was a teacher for the first fifteen years of my working life five years outdoor education, teaching geography and ecology then ten years as Museum Education Officer with Dundee Museums and Art Galleries (mostly primary school children in Dundee). I am well aware of the value of children being out of doors, and have been pleased to be instrumental in getting a grant from the Mushroom Trust which has enabled the upper primary children to establish a garden in the grounds of St Ninian's Cathedral. I should hate to see this initiative come to an end.
- One could think of closer connection to Cathedral artistic, theatrical, RE etc. consider role of school in the move to regenerate Perth as a City of Culture.
- PKC help to advertise the school to increase numbers if that is what is required in their view. Small communities/schools have many benefits and help more 'challenging' children to thrive and develop whereas in a large school they would just continue to be 'challenging'.
- Certainly don't want schools of that age and stage to be too big and impersonal.
- School appears to be in good order structurally and good decorative state.
- No, they should stay the same.
- After school club, nursery, better playground more child friendly.
- With the school having no designated catchment I feel the council could assist boost class sizes. The more personal teaching approach without doubts reaps rewards. Please do not close St Ninian's.
- My preferred option would be different from those listed overleaf. My belief is that youngsters are not all suited nor benefit from 'large community' and would benefit rather from small community type schools. Many people come into Perth to work and a primary school en route would be valued – especially

- one with such an excellent educational ethos as SNP. I think it should be promoted.
- Add to the school a bigger link with the 600 families linked with Autism.
- Not aware of any review the position after a year or two our current situation is too unsettled perhaps after BREXIT? a forlorn hope?
- Not to my knowledge

Community Drop-In Session

Drop-in session ran from 3pm – 7pm on 30 August 2017

- 109 attendees signed in at the session
- 40% (44) of attendees were parents
- 25% (27) were from the Church
- 10% (11) "other family members"
- 10% (11) "staff"
- 14% (15) "others"
- 1% (1) were neighbours of the school

Comments received at the drop-in session

Option 1 – Do nothing

- This school works well for all the pupils here and should be kept open. Its location close to Perth City Centre is valuable to the community.
- Testimony of former pupils means a lot. Essential part of local community. Good placing of school. Ethos/cathedral community adds distinctiveness and direction to area and of other schools.
- Being an Episcopal school is a good link between church and community.
- This school's community ethos is amazing; it has benefitted many young people with learning difficulties.
- The school and its staff are treasures. It's a village school in a city setting. The cathedral connection is great. My grandchild loves it here and is thriving.
- Keep the school operating as it has been with links to the church and community. Individual children are valued and taught appropriately.
- Best Option! Keep the 'village school' advantages for pupils, flexible use of the building to best meet needs. Added value of links with cathedral & gateway & community.
- The school has a great environment. The children thrive. We have a brilliant relationship with the kids and teachers over at PKAVS. The intergenerational work we do has made a real impact for all ages.
- Keep open. Wonderful school. We at PKAVS work with the children and wish to carry on

- This school has a wonderful social mix leave it alone. Excellent staff family connections. Primary children need to feel part of 'local' community. Ripping the heart out of Perth
- Leave it alone. It's a fabulous school with wonderful staff! It's a great community school and its great having the Gateway and Cathedral to support the pupils.
- Both my children currently go to the school, both supported. Can't thank the school enough. I travel from Methven to bring them and want my other two children to come too. THIS SCHOOL NEEDS TO STAY OPEN.
- All our pupils currently choose to attend St Ninian's primary school. Children travel from as far as Pitlochry as we have a great wee family.
- This school isn't a catchment school; we chose this school based on Quality of Education and closeness with staff. I choose to walk 30 minutes to come to this school when North Muirton Primary is at the end of my street.
- This is a 'Closing the Gap' school. Supposed to be a Scottish Government priority. This so-called consultation clearly shows that CtG bids are not a priority.
- This would be best but with council support for advertising its availability, location etc plus teachers and activities.
- Went to view all schools before choosing St Ninian's, found a few other schools had a huge influx of foreign speaking children which my son would feel isolated! (Our Lady's).
- This is the only option! Where do our children go? Our children in nurture, what happens to them? With all the new houses being built around Muirton, surely our numbers would increase as St Johns are at capacity and Balhousie are also on the review list!
- This is a great school, if it was promoted more to people in the area and if it
 was more easily identified when searching online, it could increase enrolment
 numbers.
- Close Bertha Park. Keep St Ninian's.
- Must do something if 'things' are not quite right but closing the school is not an option. Many new houses are being built.
- Very misleading information sheet:
 - 1. Roll is 64 and rising
 - 2. Option 1 'Do nothing' indicates a desire for closure! It should state 'continue as a denominational school.
 - 3. The school is popular and growing the empty room is needed for next vear's intake.
 - 4. The school is at the heart of Perth in an area with many challenges to close it would damage Perth City Centre.
 - 5. We should provide at least one school where the ethos is Christianity this will be important for all faiths not just Christian.

- Considerations seem to be purely economic a bad basis for educational decisions. Keep option 1.
- School should remain open, is small, convenient and my son loves it.
- I believe the school should remain open, Episcopalian and more children encouraged to enrol from local primaries.
- Keep the school, it's amazing. Teacher's fab. Leave alone!
- Children with learning difficulties, special needs, speech & language would benefit greatly from St Ninian's due to the homely, nurturing, happy atmosphere and receive one to one attention when needed within the (NEST) as this has helped my son.
- Leave the school the way it is. This school is more like a big family and it is a better environment for the children than large schools. The children should be a priority!
- From a Granny with two grandchildren, I think the school and teachers and pupils work well and enjoy coming to the school. Everyone cares and it shows daily. Leave the school alone.
- My son has Autism and the only school I would ever put him to due to his sensory issues and his language and behaviour has exceeded all expectations due to the caring attitude and nurturing of the staff and environment.
- Only school within the area that has a modern attitude towards religion and makes children aware of ALL religious attitudes and practices.
- All our kids come on leaps and bounds while attending this school. They are very close knit and children in this day and age need that.
- While tempted to say 'do nothing', I think the council could possibly applaud what is happening within these walls caring, nurturing, being aware of children's needs etc etc and perhaps help more?
- Keep St Ninian's the way it is, a nurturing, caring and hugely respectful environment for children to grow. Grow into adults to be proud of, not lost within NUMBERS! Not about numbers.
- Do nothing But only because good things are going on here. Of course new ideas are always welcome but I reckon they are happening anyway.
- No need to close a building that doesn't need fixed, where pupils, parents and staff love. It works well for work and being close to home. This school is a wonderful inviting place to be. The school should be made more aware of by others in the area.
- Leave our school. This is a great school, there is a good relationship between parents and teachers. My child really struggled with people. The school has grown in numbers this year and can continue.
- St Ninian's is a great school with committed staff, a positive ethos, a safe and structured place of learning for the increasing number of pupils. As a, I cannot see why PKC wants to close it.

- My granddaughter came to this school as it is a small, family friendly and nurturing school. Her going to a bigger school IS NOT AN OPTION. A lot of the children in the school would not get the support in a bigger school.
- Not 150 Capacity! Every school needs a library (books are knowledge). Every school needs a quiet space (NEST) for children to have quiet time and not 40 children to one class! Only 3 teachers.
- Every classroom is used. School needs a library. School needs a nurturing room for (TIME OUT) for children with special needs and learning sensory issues. My son needed this with his sensory issues.
- For an accurate understanding of the school capacity, a full audit needs to be undertaken of the school buildings. A classroom has been demolished by the council yet capacity remains at 150 pupils? This makes no sense!
- The school is working excellent. Council's figures are wrong.
- Keep the school as it is! The numbers that the council have are clearly wrong.
 Cramming 150 children in will have a terrible impact on the children's learning.
 It is more important to support the different needs of each pupil. Even suggesting taking the LRC or the nest away is disgusting! The priority should be individual care needs of each child.
- The school numbers are rising (council figures wrong). Teachers and staff and Mrs GS are excellent. Pupils are all happy and achieving as they should.
- Do nothing is a misleading statement! I understand that the school at present has both children with attachment to their Cathedral and also no denominational status. The catchment area could be widened and also recognise the unique school here and opportunities available.
- School roll is increasing again. The service for pupils here meets individual needs that may not be met so successfully in another setting i.e. bigger.
- Both of my children have attended this school. It is a school with a community feel, friendly attitude from staff and children and is slowly gaining more pupils.
 To close this school would be a terrible decision. I feel we should continue to encourage more pupils to join our lovely school.
- I don't think anything should be done. It's a nice, small school and the children all look happy. The staff are friendly and approachable.
- I chose to send my daughter to St Ninian's because of her needs. Our catchment school and even other schools in closer proximity did not have the smaller classrooms and the LACK OF CHANGE that some other schools have due to being so large. Closing or even changing the school will be detrimental to many of the children's education and lives!
- I have been to this school for seven years and left to go to the Grammar. I have missed this school and I liked it very much. It is the best school. Because of the small numbers, it was a bit more of a one to one. I knew all of the staff and got on well. I felt comfortable talking to them. I DO NOT want the school to close. I think it is wonderful just the way it is. I have been offered to move school before and not once have I thought I want to move. One of my

friends moved here in P5 and he said he never wanted to go back, he loved it here and so did I. I am enjoying S1 because I was well prepared from P1 to P7. Please leave this wonderfully, amazing school alone!

- Keep school open. Its small calmer atmosphere allows giving children as much attention as they deserve.
- A modern approach to RELIGION from all sides! Teachers respect! Love! Kindness, social awareness so our children grow up to respect EVERYONE!
- Academically and socially this school has supported both my children to develop into articulate, caring and confident young people.
- Best Option 1.
- Do Nothing
- Do Nothing
- Yes, yes, yes! This is the perfect way to go!
- All the staff here are amazing and the kids and ourselves would be gutted to lose it.
- Yes, leave it alone.
- Do nothing, it's not broken, doesn't need fixed, excellent school.
- Doing nothing would be the best option.
- No other school in Perth like it.
- Why close a perfectly good school?
- Doing nothing would be the best option.
- Best option! Do nothing!
- I agree, do nothing
- I agree, do nothing
- This is an amazing wee school. Please keep it open, thank you.
- Do nothing, do nothing, do nothing.
- Do nothing. Kids and parents love the school. Teachers are amazing! Lovely small school.
- Do nothing. Most of the children are happy with the current state of the school.
- Daughter loves the school. I love the school. Teachers and Headteacher are fab.
- Of the 4 options only 'do nothing' is logical (Option 1).
- Leave the school as it is, I love this school for my grandson.
- Please continue with the school and maintain status quo. Do nothing.
- Do nothing. I am happy that my son is getting space to grow in this school. He loves the school environment.
- Do nothing. My son is very comfortable in this school and as a parent we are totally satisfied with the school.

Option 2: School remains open – remove denominational status of school and create a new non-denominational catchment for the school.

- Ok removing denominational status.
- Why have any religious schools? More inclusive society if we remove all denominational status.
- Open the catchment and give the school the chance to get more pupils.
- Option 2 would be better as catchment area changes might get more pupils to school and good atmosphere.
- I support the school maintaining links with the cathedral could this remain even if denominational status was removed?
- Keep church status and leave it as numbers are going up.
- Keep denominational status.
- Retain school & Episcopal links. Always been a welcoming, inclusive school!
- Retain school and Episcopal connection. Known as a very good school.
- The school offers many links between church & community; it would be a shame to lose these links.
- To remove our connection with the church would be a very bad idea. The support they offer the school and families is priceless, financially and educationally.
- Love the connection with the cathedral Kids/Parents benefit greatly.
- The connection with the cathedral is a wonderful bonus. The kids share in church tradition and no matter their ethnic origin, they can learn good values here.
- I don't think the denomination should be removed as there are Episcopalian children at the school. The church not only helps with a good moral standard to follow, it also gives the kids more space to let them grow as individuals and helps to keep costs lower to parents.
- Keep this school open! Keep our connection with the church! Keep promoting our fab school and boost our intake!
- Removing denominational status will not have any value addition. In fact the kids may benefit in learning value if the denominational status is kept open.
- Leave as Episcopal school.
- Not a good option. Will lose unique link with Perth's Episcopal Cathedral and all this brings to the experience of pupils.
- The Episcopal connection is excellent good for children to be aware (if not participating) in their religious/Christian background and traditions. Too much interference and watering down of people's beliefs.
- I don't think you should remove the denominational status, I think having the link with the church is good for the children and the school, also for parent

- involvement. Thinking back to when I was at school, it was all part of the routine and like this for my child.
- I don't think contact with the cathedral should be lost, it's good for kids and parents.
- Having a community with the cathedral is very important. They support the school and the families. It is ridiculous that they would take this away. You wouldn't do it if we were a catholic school.
- St Ninian's is the ONLY Episcopal school in Perth so needs to remain open.
- Do not remove the denominational status
- Do not remove the denominational status
- Can't believe you can close a school that has links to Episcopal faith. This
 would be met with such controversy if a Catholic/Muslim/other faith school
 was being threatened.
- What benefits would accrue from this that could not already be had? What dis-benefits would occur (additional funds/support are given by the Episcopal Church)?
- The school currently accepts pupils from any denomination and catchment area so there is no need to change its denominational status.
- It would be very sad to lose connection with the church as it has worked for such a long time.
- Removing the denominational status would also mean a loss of community links with the church and all the good it brings to the school.
- But school has always had a policy of welcoming ALL pupils regardless of denominational status.
- Why change something that was with us for so long.
- Risks losing charitable funding, extra-curricular resources and interested congregation contacts.
- The connection with the church is a great way for the kids to learn Christian traditions and values. Why would anyone want to discourage/stop something good and valuable in our community?
- The wider school community is much appreciated and well received and everyone gains from this. Cathedral especially is a huge value/benefit.
- Denominational status is vitally important to the community.
- Why do you need to remove the denominational status of the school? We have had and continue to have strong links with the cathedral. We continue to promote our school through attending the Little Cherubs and through PKAVS. We have had an increase in children enrolling for P1 from toddler group.
- Links with the church are very important and shouldn't be removed.
- Loss of Episcopal link would be damaging for children as they use the garden space and church for festivals in addition to receiving both financial aid and lessons in citizenship.
- Keep denomination status, very beneficial even if not practising for all.
- No reason to remove denomination, church has been fab for the school.

- Keep the denominational status of the school as there are close connections with the church and school and good community links.
- No! Further erosion of church and community. If this was a Catholic or Muslim school, PKC would never suggest this.
- Why can school not have catchment and denomination?
- Why do you need to remove the denominational status or the school? Create a new catchment area for denominational and non-denominational together.
- Catchment does not guarantee increased role and loose community resource so integral to the school ethos.
- No way!
- This school welcomes all faiths and educates on Cultural tolerance as big part of ethos due to the cathedral.
- Cathedral teaches the children respect of others, working with elderly, toddlers, activities – in and outdoor space, fundraising, charity work and lessons.
- I am non-faith but feel this is a unique village/small community in a large town/city very unique.
- As a former pupil, my education here allowed me to gain a First class Honours degree at university.
- Former pupils have one of the best educations in Perth. Let them learn and represent what is good about small inner city schools.
- Reconnect like it used to be, we should work together to save this school.
- Catchment would improve if PKC did not list St Ninians below all other schools including High Schools.
- My catchment area school is also on the review list!
- Church affiliation does not deter parents.
- Do Nothing.
- No
- What would the catchment be? How could you get exact numbers for small size, i.e. more than 69/100 capacity?

Option 3: School remains open – extend the provision of other Perth & Kinross Council services and utilise space within the school for these services.

- Option 3 would be better if school space is utilised properly.
- Preferred Option to enable to reduce costs for council and open up much needed central space for meetings, etc. School is a champion school with active travel, no congestion issues and the majority of children travel actively because of the school's location.
- School should remain open as well as extending other appropriate services.

- Option 3. Please ensure the other council services are within E & Cs! Within such an option, the existing denominational school and other uses will fit comfortably. Specialisms in 1-1 education/art/music/Gaelic? All good. In this age of ENFORCED budget austerity it is necessary to be creative and accept compromise for the better good of all, including the denominational school.
- This option would be acceptable.
- The extra rooms should be used for nursery or after school club.
- Preferred option extend provisions. After school club at the school might encourage working people to send their children to St Ninian's school.
- Option 3 appears to be the best possible choice as unutilized spaces would be used for other essential services by the council.
- Ok as long as no impact on current pupils activities on offer.
- This is a really good alternative and would offer so much opportunity for the community to see what a fantastic school St Ninian's is.
- Is there room where the demolished porch/car park is, could a new purpose build facility be built – Nursery? Community space? Special needs? Gaelic School?
- Why just PKC services and no other providers such as NGO's?
- A nursery would get more children in the school; parents do not have to change schools. Children get continuity too.
- I think the school should remain open, with after school care or nursery options being made available! I would not want the school to close as it's a great school with supportive teachers!
- To open an after school club to use extra room or a nursery class or both.
- School should remain open and utilise space for nursery etc.
- Use St Ninian's for an after school club provision.
- Can parts of the school be used for wider community after school hours?
- Needs a nursery. Needs an after school club.
- After school care and/or nursery would be welcomed by parents.
- Nursery would be a good idea and after school clubs.
- I think a nursery would be good in the school, even a small 20/20 run nursery, would then help boost numbers for the intake in primary one.
- Expand the ethos and offer a nurture room provision and support.
- After school club would benefit pupils and working parents as St Johns charges £10 per day for this service.
- Any visiting support services needing re-homed? Use empty rooms for this?
- Option 3 This would deprive children of either a music/drama room or the Nest. Neither would benefit attainment of education.
- Where? We currently have 1 classroom with is 'free'! This is used for music, drama and visiting specialists. This is also used for meetings in school; we have no other suitable space.

- Small class sizes allow for an inclusive education. Larger schools care about numbers, not about pupil's quality of education.
- There are already spaces available in other council buildings and campuses in the surrounding areas that are available in Perth and Kinross council. I feel that our school would not benefit from this decision.
- No the apparent 'extra' space in the school is well used for 1-1 tuition or help for kids who struggle with English. As numbers expand the space will be much needed.
- So let other people and strangers into a primary? No thanks.
- I am concerned. Capacity 150 involving turning office space into classroom
 how can you offer Gaelic lessons but no admin?
- The P1 intake this year is 17. If P1 intake next year is a similar size, the only remaining classroom would be in use. A school exists for children, so they should have priority, not to bar children from admission here to accommodate other services – such as Gaelic!
- The council have ample provision and spaces elsewhere for them to use. The school would NOT BENEFIT from this decision.
- I don't think this is a good idea as it will take away space from the kids that already attend here.
- Losing admin office/staffroom?
- Let the school just be a school. They clearly use the space for the best outcome of the children. There are many other PKC buildings that can and are used. Campuses are underused.
- Gaelic is a language in which 0.1% of the population speaks and majority in the Islands! Not of use in modern day society!
- Using the nurture/nest space for classes would risk the kids who need this space losing time and resources and classrooms being more disrupted.
- Perhaps out of hours to maximise cost of heating but not a sensible option.
 Puts pressure on teaching staff if things disappear etc.
- Might be possible to use for services out of school hours. Not advisable.
- I strongly feel the school needs to stay open as all our children love it here. They like the fact that it is a smaller school for children to benefit from one to one attention and quality time with their teacher.

Option 4: Consider closing school and pupils attend catchment schools.

- Best financial response allows resources etc to be purchased. May not be right for all children in a larger building however.
- Closing down this school is not an option, sorry, find your savings somewhere else.

- Please do not close this wonderful unique school. Its position in the community is valuable. It also offers a place for other pupils in other catchment areas who will benefit from the smaller classes and committed teachers who work here.
- No, not at all, this school is a lovely, well run school, very friendly and it would be a shame to lose that.
- Shameful! Do the children matter?
- The location of this school is very important for the local community and the wider catchment areas as it offers a unique option for a well-run school in a smaller school. Please do not close it down.
- Not a very good idea. Just let parents and kids choose a school good for their kids.
- Leave school open. No need to close a perfectly good school down. LEAVE IT BE!
- NOT PREFERRED OPTION. School is a champion in active travel and has no school gate congestion issues. Closing school and moving to another school could impact on any existing congestion issues.
- NOT AN OPTION. KEEP SCHOOL OPEN. COUNCIL FIGURES ARE WRONG.
- I'm a parent of a 2 year old and was thinking of giving my child to this school. Do not close the school.
- Do not close school.
- Not an option. Perth needs a small school. Some children don't like a crowd of people.
- Not an option! This is the best possible school for my child! All staff are excellent and very supportive.
- Do not close school.
- Do not close this school!
- Do not close. Will lose a vital resource for pupils in the area. Too much disruption to current pupils education.
- Ludicrous decision.
- Local children will be unable to walk elsewhere. Unhealthy option. Why advertise walking to school?
- This is a good school and should be kept to serve local children.
- Location is very important. Balhousie is also under review.
- Current provision at various neighbouring primaries is obviously also 'in scope' for possible change. If parents are actively choosing to send pupils here what is the draw and attraction? Hopefully this consultation will highlight this. Working as a partner to this school and the others in PGS cluster, I understand this particular school to be a warm, open, inclusive and welcoming learning environment. The dynamic between staff and pupils is different in a smaller school to lose that across a cluster is something that should be considered.

- My son loves this school, teachers, pupils and his learning. It would be very unfair to take my son away from his friends and his teachers.
- We are a growing school with loads to offer so why take a good thing and close it?
- With our connection to the church, we already save you money to put funding into other schools. In my eyes, closing this school is a bad move and one I do not support.
- I doubt that this could be an option with other local schools with higher numbers. What about the staff? There has been no mention of job security?
- Would show council puts money (and poor stats) over quality education and attainment.
- Why would you close a school where children thrive in their learning and the school has such a good ethos in the community?
- Pupils will be lost in a bigger school. Further to travel, less staff to deal with needs.
- School is a great school, the children are all happy just like one big family and
 it shows through the children's learning I really do think it would be the
 wrong decision to close the school, especially also as my daughter is just
 starting P1.
- We work really closely with the school children and staff. A closure would be a
 great loss for the day centre at PKAVS and all the work we do together. Local
 generations come together because of the school.
- This school is part of our community and as such needs to remain a part of it!
- Do not close school. Teachers are brilliant. Sending kids to catchment schools would mean bigger classes and less 1:1 time. Small classes mean more time with teachers and the kids that need that bit extra help can get it here!
- What a loss to the local area closure would be. Why close a perfectly good school with lovely staff and a wonderful warm atmosphere.
- All very well putting children in catchment schools but what if the child has specific needs?! Sensory issues (crowds & noise), speech & language etc. Large primaries would NOT DO!
- Catchment school is Balhousie which is also up for review. Do you think it's acceptable to disrupt child's education to move to another school which can close?
- The school should remain open as other catchment schools cannot accommodate more pupils.
- Local catchment schools either over-subscribed already or poor educational attainment record and low staff morale, staff absences etc. – not a good option.
- Worry if 'nurture' classroom used for increased role. Many children are here because of nurture facility (they have come from other schools because of this).
- Do not want daughter to go to catchment school.

- All pupils in this school are here because their parents actively chose it, not because it is their catchment. The reasons for this are many, varied and with sound basis. Many children pass their catchment school to get here. Also catchment school may be very large this does not suit lots of primary children. Here we provide Nurture, without which some pupils would not cope socially/emotionally. What then? Poor behaviour □ multiple exclusions □ offending behaviour □ prison □ huge cost to wider society, disaster for individual and their families.
- Did not want to go to catchment school awful reputation.
- I do not wish to send my child to my catchment school as I feel this smaller school has a better reputation as a school. The children are all well behaved in the playground.
- Our children would then be subjected to bigger, overcrowded classrooms, something not every child would deal well with.
- If pupils were sent to other catchment schools, they would lose the connection with the cathedral which is very valuable to the school and cathedral users/members.
- With the list of schools also on the list of Estate Transformation, I would worry
 as to exactly where my catchment school would be. School closing is not an
 option in my opinion.
- Catchment schools themselves are in trouble. Would add to traffic congestions in North Muirton area as current children walk to school.

Are there any other options that you would like to propose for the school?

- I think the school should continue its great work.
- Dispel the myth that the school is for the 'hard to school' children and more local families will jump at the chance to use a place at this great school.
 Provide additional teaching resources as school is now 68% of capacity.
- Consider both a catchment and keep denominational status.
- Possibility of childcare during in-service days and holidays. After school activities. Advertise the school by putting it on PKC website on list of schools.
- Just to continue as it is.
- The school, although denominational, already can have a wide catchment area what advertising of this occurs?
- Keep the school as it is.
- Some of the questions are very misleading and could therefore overly influence the consultation report. Consultation is good, but needs to be open, transparent and fair to gain most effective results.

- Teacher numbers be increased to enable the roll to increase. Long-term commitment from council.
- Over-subscribed local primary schools parents should be actively encouraged to contact St Ninian's. Better advertising of the school by the council – commit to help increasing the visibility of school and increasing the role.
- What options are there for joint discussions between St Ninian's and Balhousie? They are not miles apart, they have different facilities in terms of sustainability, could offer better options if considered together.
- Continue just like it is.
- This school is the best, link with Autism, ADD, family after school.
- Amazing teachers.
- Nursery after school club.
- The school is in a central location with the ability for pupils to walk/cycle both to school and to other facilities such as swimming pool, Bells, Dewar's, North Inch, etc. Need to think of connections beyond the building asset i.e. sustainability, links to wider community.
- Small class sizes re proven to get better academic results.
- This school offers a unique service and ethos. Leave it alone.
- A great school. Leave well alone!
- We love this school and so do our grandchildren!
- After school club.
- Extend the school and its <u>ethos</u>. Family friendly connecting with business sector, voluntary sector as well as the Episcopal Church.
- Keep it as it is.
- Leave school be! Amazing school. No issues.

What are the reasons for the school roll declining over the years?

- Bigger school is being opened. Not enough advertisement of school.
- Bigger schools opening with after school clubs etc. But bigger is not always better and I feel our recent influx of kids shows that.
- Since building the new schools in the area, people are choosing to put their kids there and other schools numbers suffer.
- Families not living in town centres or putting children to catchment area schools for convenience!
- No after school club?
- Families moving away. After-school club.
- Families coming over for exchange jobs for Aviva/SSE then leaving after a year.

- Very mobile community e.g. short contract workers.
- It could be due to more increase in the elderly population within the area than children been born.
- Poor advertising by council of this school as an option for any pupil website
 of council needs reviewed.
- Poor advertising need to increase its popularity.
- People may be under the impression that it is an exclusive school when it is not
- When I looked on PKC website to find my catchment school, St Ninian's is not there, why? I found out about this wonderful school by word of mouth.
- No good website for the school generic, clunky (PTA have just funded a new one!).
- The PKC website demotes the position of the school in the catchment section of the website.
- Are the 'Perth' inhabitants aware that the school is open to any child no catchment.
- School not advertised on website.
- There has been a marked increase recently (now 68) due to reputation of teaching staff, quality of education. Now a thriving, nurturing and positive experience for pupils.
- School pupil numbers are not accurate. Capacity is not 150 as council knocked down 2 classrooms. Capacity is 100. Capacity is 75 as teacher number has been reduced. Council figures are inaccurate.
- The roll is going up.
- Roll is increasing, not decreasing. Falsely inflated in 2009 when St Johns pupils were decanted here. Currently 68.
- Incorrect roll/capacity stats broadcast by P&KC. Why would the council do this? A done deal already, perhaps? Another Cale Road flat development?
- The roll has increased and class room number decreased. Numbers are wrong.
- Feel this school is forgotten about which it shouldn't. Fantastic school, keep it up you guys.
- This Headmistress and staff are TOP CLASS. LAST 2 WERE RUBBISH!
- Reputation past quality of teaching lack of management by council. Word of mouth – now better teachers and better teaching results.
- This headmistress would like to encourage more out of school clubs.

What are your reasons for choosing St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School for your preferred school?

- I chose St Ninian's as I am Episcopalian, also the school is nearby and fits in with work. I also chose the school as it is a smaller school.
- I am Episcopalian and was delighted to send my child to a school with such strong links to the cathedral.
- Excellent use of community resources Cathedral, North Inch, Bells, PUHI.
- Love the links with the cathedral. The kids can use their garden space.
- I would like the school to remain open because of its location for parents dropping off on their way to work. I would hate for this community to be lost because of the links to the cathedral (option 3).
- Links with cathedral.
- Small, supportive, friendly school. Nurturing. Good Reputation. Excellent links with cathedral.
- Links with cathedral toddler group since new head teacher came. P7 send over 2 children every week for an hour to help with children for community project.
 - 1. State school (like my own).
 - 2. Small school size.
 - 3. Known supportive environment.
 - 4. Confident my child would get a great education and turn out a good person
- My daughter needs a small class and more focused education. St Ninian's provides that perfectly. Also I am a member of St Ninian's Cathedral
- Small, nurturing school. Very supportive staff. Cosy internal feel.
- Small, friendly, fab staff and Headteacher. Did not want catchment school. Word of mouth. Great wee school.
- School caters for children who need small classes. Excellent school.
- The size of the school makes it possible for teachers to devote quality time for the pupils.
- Only a 5 minute walk from our house on the way to my work. My kid loves this school. It is small and easy to settle in and have more time to chat with teachers etc. Also enjoy the fact that the kids go to church.
- I chose St Ninian's for my little girl to start as I like the fact that it is a smaller school in a good place. She would not cope in the bigger campus schools where they all seem to be getting overrun at the moment and the quality and time is taking away from the children.
- Friendly approachable staff on enquiring.
- Small numbers as I went to a small school myself.
- Family feel.
- Can walk from home to school.
- Small class sizes kids love it. Older kids work with younger reading promotes leadership and respect.
- I chose this school for the reason of smaller classes. Can't recommend this school enough.

- I chose St Ninian's because it is a smaller school with a great family like community feeling about the place.
- Good reputation for education and support for pupils of all needs. Small class size.
- Smaller school with smaller class sizes benefit my child greatly with learning.
 Friendly atmosphere. Kids are well behaved. Teachers/staff/Mrs GS are all excellent.
- Great support network. My kids feel all staff are easy to approach. Smaller school means more 1:1 time. Get a better education.
- Small community feel. Conveniently placed in town for working families. They
 made us feel welcome when we moved here. Easy to get to know people and
 a personal feel from staff.
- St Ninian's school has had a good reputation for lots of years and is situated in a convenient area of Perth.
- St Ninian's school is a small school and gives better schooling to meet children's needs. Bigger schools not necessarily better.
- Kids been coming 9 years. Close to home. Brilliant school, brilliant teachers, been great with my son who has problems in school.
- Due to my daughter's behaviour issue, I chose to put her here as she would get the option of 1:1 attention and have the opportunity to work with her teacher. I feel she has really settled into her school and has made lots of friends.
- I love that classes have small numbers of kids. They are all very good friends.
- I chose St Ninian's as our catchment area school had a bad reputation and my son had a bad experience there. Also, smaller schools give a better schooling to meet their pupil's needs.
- Catchment school Balhousie was warned poor educational opportunities 'would be brave to send your kids there'.
- My eldest child attended St Ninian's from P1-P7. My youngest child attended from P1 and is now in P7. We chose this school because of its size and location. It is friendly and focused on providing the best education for its pupils. The staff are excellent. We moved to Scone last year and still bring my son as he loves this school.
- Wanted to support local authority school, not a private school.
- Open to all high schools.
- School allows passage to any of the Perth High Schools (Grammar, High or Academy) – we liked this flexibility/freedom of choice.
- Breakfast club.
- Positive word of mouth from other parents.
- Currently S4. Was here from P1 P7. I don't want St Ninz to close coz it's the bomb dot com. It's da best.

Letter received at the community drop-in session:

St Ninian's is part of Perth's history. I personally have a 45yr connection with the school. It's a proven fact that smaller establishments and classes perform better expectation than for high scholastic performance. Standards of behaviour also high. School values such as respect ante discriminatory are mandatory. All members of staff have genuine commitment to their pupils. Praise encouragement and practical hands on approach helps the children to work toward their full potential. The school is a small cosmopolitan community where understanding of different cultures — creeds etc is taught and executed. On entering St Ninian's the ambience welcoming. Friendly smiley faces greet you and make for a relaxed visit making you feel that you have entered a large family home. In today's world St Ninian's is an oasis of learning and experience. Discipline is fair and appropriate all round support for the children makes their attendance a positive experience as it did for the children of yesterday-today and tomorrow. We as part of the family are passionate about our school.

Comments & Queries: Community Drop-In Session

- Capacity?? Numbers are wrong!!
- If I put a postcode search into the PKC schools website St Ninian's does not appear because it is denominational. St John's Primary School does appear. Why the difference?
- Could the school have a catchment area as well as keeping the denominational status?
- Is there an option to keep the school as a denominational school and give the school a catchment area? Why are the two mutually exclusive? As per St John's Primary School.
- Who pays for the cost of further travel?
- Is this a consultation OR has the school already been sold?
- I have already been told the Council have SOLD this for flats!
- Rumour has it building is sold & to be developed as flats?
- Has the school already been sold?
- Has the school already been sold? That's what we've heard. If true scandalous!!

Email Received:

Hello,

I noticed the consultation regarding St Ninian's and wondered whether the expansion of Gaelic Medium Education had been considered as part of the following option:-

 Option 3 School remains open – extend the provision of other Perth & Kinross Council services and utilise space within the school for these services

Thanks

APPENDIX 2



St Ninian's Primary Main Building Ground Floor

Current revenue costs for school	proposed for cl	osure						
Name of School St Ninians Primary School		for full cial year '-18)	impa	tional financial ct on receiving ol [Inchview PS]	impad	ional financial ct on receiving ll [Balhousie PS]	savin	ial recurring igs (column 2 s column 3 and nn 4)
School costs								
Employee costs -								
teaching staff	£	194,607.00	£	46,199.00	£	46,199.00	£	102,209.00
support staff	£	36,315.00	£	-	£	-	£	36,315.00
teaching staff training (CPD etc)	£	238.00	£	-	£	-	£	238.00
Supply costs	£	3,528.00	£	597.00	£	597.00	£	2,334.00
Slippage Target	-£	8,155.00	£		£		-£	8,155.00
Building costs:								
non domestic rates	£	12,342.00	£	-	£	-	£	12,342.00
water & sewerage charges	£	962.00	£	-	£	-	£	962.00
energy costs	£	10,618.00	£	-	£	-	£	10,618.00
cleaning (contract or inhouse)	£	16,971.00	£	-	£	-	£	16,971.00
building repair & maintenance	£	20,517.00	£	-	£		£	20,517.00
grounds maintenance	£	165.00	£	-	£	-	£	165.00
other	£	830.00	£	-	£	-	£	830.00
School operational costs:								
learning materials	£	2,255.00	£	745.20	£	703.80	£	806.00

Transport costs: note 3								
home to school	£	-	£	-	£	-	£	-
other pupil transport costs	£	-	£	-	£	-	£	-
staff travel	£	341.00	£	18.75	£	18.75	£	303.50
SCHOOL COSTS SUB-TOTAL	£	291,534.00	£	47,559.95	£	47,518.55	£	196,455.50
Income:								
Other	£	-					£	-
SCHOOL INCOME SUB-TOTAL	£	-					£	-
TOTAL COSTS MINUS INCOME FOR SCHOOL	£	291,534.00	£	47,559.95	£	47,518.55	£	196,455.50
UNIT COST PER PUPIL PER YEAR	£	4,485.14	£	2,642.22	£	2,795.21	£	3,022.39

Capital costs	School proposed fo closure	r Receiving school
	£	
Capital Life Cycle cost	-	£ -
Third party contributions to capital costs		
	£	
	-	£ -

Annual Property costs incurred (moth-balling) until disposal						
property insurance	£	-				
non domestic rates	£	12,342.00				
water & sewerage charges	£	950.00				
energy costs	£	2,650.00				
cleaning (contract or inhouse)	£	-				
security costs	£	-				
building repair & maintenance	£	-				
grounds maintenance	£	-				
other	£	-				
TOTAL ANNUAL COST UNTIL DISPOSAL	£	15,942.00				

Non-recurring revenue costs					
	£	-			
TOTAL NON-RECURRING REVENUE COSTS	£	-			

Impact on GAE		
St.Ninians to Other Schools	£	108,550.00
GAE IMPACT	£	108,550.00

1. The total costs incurred for teaching staff (row 5) and support staff (row 6) are required to be included. Column 2 should include the current costs for a full financial year for the school proposed for closure, and column 3 should include the *additional* cost to the receiving school as a result of staff transferring.

For teaching staff, this should include regular teachers, itinerant teachers, learning support teaching staff and special education (ASN) staff. Itinerant teaching staff includes central support services such as English as additional language support, hearing, visually impaired services, educational psychology services.

For support staff, this should include classroom assistants, administration staff and janitorial staff.

For all staff the costs entered should include salary, NI and pension costs.

If the school proposed for closure has less than 3 staff members, then the cumulative staff costs only should be given in row 5 (for both teaching and support staff), so as to avoid possible disclosure of individual salaries.

Training costs should be identified separately in rows 7 and 8.

2. Supply costs to cover teaching and support staff. This may be held in a central budget, be devolved or shared across the budgets.
3. 'Home to school' pupil transport costs should include those school transport costs incurred in accordance with Council policy. 'Other pupil transport costs' will cover costs incurred for the transport of pupils for activities such as swimming etc
4. Row 30 of column 3 should include the additional transport costs related to the increased home to school transport arrangements that are put in place in accordance with Council policy. This figure is therefore likely to be considerably higher than current costs.

5. This table is to capture the impact on the revenue support grant as a result of changes to GAE. Impact on GAE should consider the issues

covered in the GAE section of the guidance document that accompany this template.

6. Facilities management costs will include costs related to caretakering, janitorial and security.

7. The capital costs for the receiving school should be taken across the life cycle of the school in line with the life expectancy of that school. The capital costs for the school proposed for closure should be taken across the same life cycle period.

The Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation (SIMD) identifies small area concentrations of multiple deprivation across all of Scotland in a consistent way. It allows effective targeting of policies and funding where the aim is to wholly or partly tackle or take account of area concentrations of multiple deprivation. SIMD provides information to help improve the understanding about the outcomes and circumstances of people living in the most deprived areas in Scotland.

SIMD ranks to quintiles, deciles and vigintiles. Quintiles split data zones into 5 groups, each containing 20% of data zones. The lower the quintile the more deprived the area.

ACORN is a well-developed segmentation tool which categorises the UK's population into demographic types. Acorn segments households, postcodes and neighbourhoods into 6 categories, 18 groups and 62 types, based on a range of different data collected in many ways.

ACORN is used to understand life and living conditions, lifestyles, behaviours and attitudes and can therefore help inform the public service needs of neighbourhoods and households.

There are 5 categories ACORN reports on; Category 1 Affluent Achievers, Category 2 Rising Prosperity, Category 3 Comfortable Communities, Category 4 Financially Stretched and Category 5 Urban Adversity.

Category 5 indicates the level of deprivation within an area.

Proposed Catchment

Pre-school Children

A mapping analysis of children's addresses has been carried out to identify whether there could be a sustainable non-denominational catchment created for St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School.

Information used within the analysis includes data supplied by the NHS which details the following;

Area	Existing catchment	Number of children aged under 5
Yellow	Balhousie Primary School (South of catchment area)	39
Orange	Inch View Primary School (adjacent to St Ninians)	45
Blue	Inch View Primary School (adjacent to the orange area)	47

The number of children detailed is the total number of children born between 1/3/2013 and 28/2/2017 living in these areas and registered with a GP practice. These children are able to attend school between 2018 and 2021.

Due to data protection we are not able to differentiate between the age groups of these children so for the purposes of this analysis it is has been assumed that an equal split of these numbers would attend school as Primary 1 pupils over the four year period.

If these pupils attended St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School the projected school roll taking cognisance of existing pupils (Census 2017) would be as follows;

Yellow area only - Option A

Class	2017/18	2018/19	2019/20	2020/21	2021/22
P1	17	10	10	10	10
P2	12	17	10	10	10
P3	8	12	17	10	10
P4	8	8	12	17	10
P5	8	8	8	12	17
P6	5	8	8	8	12
P7	7	5	8	8	8
Total	65	68	73	75	77

Orange area only – Option B

Class	2017/18	2018/19	2019/20	2020/21	2021/22
P1	17	12	12	12	12
P2	12	17	12	12	12
P3	8	12	17	12	12
P4	8	8	12	17	12
P5	8	8	8	12	17
P6	5	8	8	8	12
P7	7	5	8	8	8
Total	65	70	77	81	85

Yellow and orange area only - Option C

Class	2017/18	2018/19	2019/20	2020/21	2021/22
P1	17	22	22	22	22
P2	12	17	22	22	22
P3	8	12	17	22	22
P4	8	8	12	17	22
P5	8	8	8	12	17
P6	5	8	8	8	12
P7	7	5	8	8	8
Total	65	80	97	111	125

In order for the area marked in blue to be zoned as catchment the area marked in orange would also need to be considered due to geographical layout.

Orange and blue area only - Option D

Class	2017/18	2018/19	2019/20	2020/21	2021/22
P1	17	24	24	24	24
P2	12	17	24	24	24
P3	8	12	17	24	24
P4	8	8	12	17	24
P5	8	8	8	12	17
P6	5	8	8	8	12
P7	7	5	8	8	8
Total	65	82	101	117	133

The analysis has been developed on the basis of a school with capacity for 125 pupils. The outcome of the analysis is as follows:

- Option A, the South of the Balhousie catchment area, would not increase the capacity much above current pupil numbers.
- Option B, Inch View catchment just South of St Ninian's, has slightly more pupils but does not utilise the school fully.

- Option C, which includes Option A and B together, would breach the school roll after 2021/22.
- Option D, a larger part of the Inch View catchment would also breach capacity.

Primary Pupils

There are currently (Census 2017) 52 (Blue), 46 (Orange) and 28 (Yellow) primary school pupils living in these areas.

It should be noted that in the event of a catchment area being created for St Ninian's Episcopal Primary School these pupils would be under no obligation to attend their catchment school and could remain at their current school.

