

Issue 23b	Perth Area (within Core) Perth City New Sites	
Development plan reference:	5.2 – Perth, page 75-81	Reporter: Hugh M Begg
Body or person(s) submitting a representation raising the issue (including reference number):		
Lynne Palmer (00239) Lidl UK (00393) Gannochy & Kinnoull Community Council (00667) Annelie Carmichael (00731) Deirdre A Beaton (00741) George Beaton (00742) Tarmac Quarry Products Ltd (00803)		Universities Superannuation Scheme Ltd (00844) Persephone Beer (07744) NHS Tayside (09094) Peter Tod (09142) Perth City West LLP (09462) Direct Flooring (10162) John Munro (10277)
Provision of the development plan to which the issue relates:	New sites within Perth City	
Planning authority's summary of the representation(s):		
<p><u>Friarton Quarry</u> Tarmac Quarry Products Ltd (00803/1/001): The employment designation is not wholly compatible with surrounding land uses which are primarily residential recreation and employment uses. The employment designation is not compatible with the prominent location on the southern boundary of the settlement. The site (S4_Doc_002) offers an opportunity to live work and play in the same location and offers an opportunity to enhance the recreational use of the adjoining area such as Buckie Braes and St Magdalene's Hill through the integration of the proposed recreational uses. The site can be laid out to accommodate residential employment and leisure uses (layout supplied). The site is still a working quarry. .</p> <p><u>Riggs Road</u> Lidl UK (00393/1/002): The site (S4_Doc_002) has been marketed since 2006 in an attempt to find a developer and no interest has been shown for anything that complies with the existing local plan policy framework (Core_Doc_003) and which is essentially the same as the LDP framework. There has been some interest from non employment uses including residential and quasi residential uses such as care homes. It would be more appropriate to identify the site for mixed uses given the proximity of the town centre and the mixture of adjoining uses. The range of uses allowed under the terms of Policy ED1B (S4_Doc_483) is considered to be appropriate for the site. National policy set out in SPP (Core_Doc_048) indicates that when economic development sites are not appropriate or marketable they should be reallocated to another use through the development plan. Identifying the site for mixed use would allow it to come forward during the life of the Plan, contributing to the LDP's key objective of promoting a flourishing and diverse local economy.</p> <p>Direct Flooring (10162/1/001): The area (S4_Doc_002) already has some features of a secondary location with a wide variety of quasi retail and other non-industrial uses and would be a logical extension to the city centre or an extension to the commercial centre</p>		

designated at the adjoining retail park. The site already has permission for bulky goods and though an appeal for class 1 retailing was dismissed the site has potential for a wide range of uses. Retail should be identified as an appropriate use for the area.

Murray Royal Hospital

Gannochy & Kinnoull Community Council (00667/2/001): The area has a population of around 4,500 people but lacks basic facilities for social capital. The surplus land at the Murray Royal Hospital (S4_Doc_001) offers an opportunity to offer accommodation to organisations which develop social capital. Such organisations would include the Perth left bank community development trust.

Gannochy and Kinnoull Community Council (00667/5/001): The Plan should mention the relocation of Kinnoull School to a more favourable location. The surplus land at the Murray Royal Hospital (S4_Doc_001) would be such a location if the road infrastructure serving the site can be addressed. A new road from the A94 to the Murray Royal Hospital site would be beneficial and could also serve the H3 Gannochy site thus reducing air pollution at Bridgend.

George Beaton (00742/3/001); Deirdre A Beaton (00741/3/001); Annelie Carmichael (00731/4/001): There is no provision in this area for social clubs or community buildings especially for young people. The surplus buildings and land at Murray Royal Hospital (S4_Doc_001) could provide an ideal location for this type of activity and retain the valuable link between the hospital and other residents of the area. There is no provision in the area for sports facilities especially for young people. The site could prove to be an ideal location for this type of use and it would maintain the valuable link between the hospital and residents of the area.

NHS Tayside (09094/2/001): The surplus land at Murray Royal Hospital (S4_Doc_001) should be identified for housing development for 250 houses. The site is brownfield land and was previously identified in the Draft Perth Plan of 2004 (Core_Doc_128). There is a presumption in favour of identifying brownfield land in the LDP and the site is deliverable with no infrastructure constraints. The site will provide useful additional effective housing land which is available in the short term. Allocating the site will help the landowners in terms of planning for its future development.

John Munro (10277/1/009): The Plan does not contain any locations for a new secondary school but it would be sensible to locate it on the east side of the river where a large number of pupils live. The existing primary school also needs to be replaced. A suitable site (no plan submitted) should be identified on Muirhall Road above the Murray Royal Hospital. A new road could link with the Scone Road.

Mount Tabor Road

Peter Tod (09142/3/002): The site (S4_Doc_001) is not used for recreational or sporting uses and should not be identified for this purpose. There is a large park with public access near by and there is no merit in retaining the site for open space. Not enough land is identified for new housing in the Kinnoull Hill area and the site has potential for 5 houses. Access to the site could be gained from Mount Tabor Road and Muirhall Road.

City Hall

Universities Superannuation Scheme Ltd (00844/1/013): The city square (S4_Doc_002) is a high profile regeneration project which has the potential to generate significant environmental benefits for Perth. It will improve the area around St John's Kirk and bring it up to date as a suitable space for modern use in line with the guidance set out in SPP

(S4_Doc_103). For the project to be a success it will require supporting development such as new cafes, restaurants, retail and leisure uses. The Plan should make references to the project and give policy support which compliments the new civic space.

Pedestrian Bridge

Lynne Palmer (00239/4/002): A new bridge over the Tay onto the North Inch would encourage walkers and cyclists to leave their cars at home thus reducing air pollution at Bridgend and help reduce greenhouse gas emissions.

Persephone Beer (07744/1/001): Appropriate funding should be allocated for cycling and walking projects in particular for the pedestrian cycle bridge over the Tay.

Former Nurses Home Taymount Terrace

NHS Tayside (09094/1/001): The site (S4_Doc_002) has development potential for mixed use and if developed for housing it could be an effective site in the short term. The site measures 0.53ha and the buildings were a former nurses' home for Perth Royal Infirmary. The buildings on the site are C listed.

Perth Auction Mart

Perth City West LLP (09462/3/001): The existing uses on the site (S4_Doc_003) cover a wider range than those defined as employment though it is not clear from the Plan exactly what this means. There is also no definition of what is meant by commercial centre though the types of uses found on the site would be found in a commercial centre. The site is brown field as the major user of the site left a number of years ago. It is not logical for the Council to designate a site at Newton farm as an opportunity (Op7) (S4_Doc_399) and not designate the former Auction Mart. A wider range of potential uses would make the site more marketable under current market conditions. There are two planning applications which relate to the development of the site for class 1 retail and a filling station (Core_Doc_105).

St John's Shopping Centre

Universities Superannuation Scheme Ltd (00844/1/021): St John's Shopping Centre (S4_Doc_002) should also be designated as an opportunity site. It would help enhance the retail offer in Perth.

Modifications sought by those submitting representations:

Friarton Quarry

Tarmac Quarry Products Ltd (00803/1/001): Friarton Quarry (S4_Doc_002) should be identified as suitable for a mixed use development.

Riggs Road

Lidl UK (00393/1/002): Identify the site (S4_Doc_002) for mixed use with Policy ED1B (S4_Doc_483) determining the appropriate uses.

Direct Flooring (10162/1/001): The site (S4_Doc_002) should be included within the city centre boundary or identified as part of the adjoining commercial centre.

Murray Royal Hospital

Gannochy & Kinnoull Community Council (00667/2/001): Identify the Murray Royal Hospital surplus land and buildings (S4_Doc_001) as an opportunity site for mixed use development which includes community facilities.

Gannochy & Kinnoull Community Council (00667/5/001):

1. Add the provision of a relocation of Kinnoull Primary School to land north-east of Murray Royal Hospital or the Murray Royal Hospital 'Surplus Assets' area (S4_Doc_001).
2. Add a provision that, should the current Kinnoull Primary School premises become available, any redeployment of the facilities must consider social capital uses.

George Beaton (00742/3/001); Deirdre A Beaton (00741/3/001); Annelie Carmichael (00731/4/001): The surplus land at Murray Royal Hospital (S4_Doc_001) should be designated as open space or for community use. The surplus buildings should be demolished or also used for the benefit of the people of Perth.

NHS Tayside (09094/2/001): A 10ha site be identified at Murray Royal Hospital (S4_Doc_001) for up to 250 houses. Design to take account of listed buildings, conservation area and adjoining residential area.

John Munro (10277/1/009): A site for an education campus should be identified on the east side of the city taking access from Muirhall Road. City Boundary and green belt adjusted accordingly.

Mount Tabor Road

Peter Tod (09142/3/002): Remove the open space zoning and identify the site for 5 houses (S4_Doc_001).

City Hall

Universities Superannuation Scheme Ltd (00844/1/013): Amend paragraph 5.2.1 to read '*The Council supports the creation of a major new civic space in St John's Square as this has the potential to generate significant economic benefits for Perth, and will further extend the use and attractiveness of the city centre*'. Add additional policy proposals for development that will support and complement the new civic space in St John's Square. These developments are expected to include shops, cafés, restaurants, pubs and clubs and visitor attractions.

Pedestrian Bridge

Lynne Palmer (00239/4/002): A new bridge over the Tay at North Inch (pedestrian and cycle only assumed) should be included in the Plan.

Persephone Beer (07744/1/001): A new pedestrian/cycle bridge should be provided over the Tay to Quarrymill as an infrastructure project set out in the Plan.

Fomer Nurses Home Taymount Terrace

NHS Tayside (09094/1/001): Identify the site as suitable for mixed uses (S4_Doc_002).

Auction Mart

Perth City West LLP (09462/3/001): The site (S4_Doc_003) should be identified as an opportunity for mixed use including retail residential and leisure.

St John's Shopping Centre

Universities Superannuation Scheme Ltd (00844/1/021): St John Shopping Centre to be designated as an opportunity site.

Summary of responses (including reasons) by planning authority:

The following responses are supported by the Council's Delivering Infrastructure Background Paper (S4_Doc_440) which outlines the key infrastructure requirements and proposed timescales to deliver the strategic development areas.

Friarton Quarry

Tarmac Quarry Products Ltd (00803/1/001): The site is a working quarry which provides aggregate materials for the construction industry and extends to some 20ha. There are still significant consented reserves and no certainty that the quarry will be worked out during the life of the Plan. As is explained in the representation there is also some uncertainty over the final contours and ground levels of the quarry if it is to be developed rather than left as rough grass which is a requirement of the mineral consent. Consequently the site is not identified as a site for development but is shown as an existing employment area where Policy ED1A (S4_Doc_483) applies.

The quarry is self contained and sits in the landscape on the southern boundary of the city with minimal impact on the surrounding areas. The visual impact of such a large extractive quarry is significantly mitigated by the extensive planting which exists on the quarry boundaries. However this means that the quarry does not have any strong links to the surrounding residential areas and in fact the reclusive nature of the site means that it would be better suited to more general employment uses which might benefit from being screened. The depth of the quarry floor and the worked out rock faces means that it will be difficult to see how an acceptable residential environment can be achieved. The low levels of passive solar gain that will be achieved on the site particularly during the winter months will make it difficult for it to be a sustainable location. It is also accepted that the quarry may have potential for leisure uses but this would be compatible with the employment designation.

The potential for identifying the quarry as potential development site can be revisited at the first review of the Plan when there will more certainty over its future.

No modification is proposed to the Plan.

Riggs Road

Lidl UK (00393/1/002): The site (S4_Doc_002) and the Lidl foodstore to the south were formally part of Frews garage. The site has been cleared for at least 8 years and there is no record of any planning applications being made for the site in that time. The area is a transitional zone between the commercial centre identified around the retail park and the residential area associated with Glasgow Road and Riggs road. The area contains a mix of uses from game dealers, motorcycle showroom, tyre sales through to offices. However there are currently no residential uses within the block delineated by the railway, Whitefriars Street and Riggs Road. To identify the area for mixed uses under the terms of Policy ED1B (S4_Doc_483) would indicate that it was suitable for housing and this would be an unacceptable loss of employment land and introduce potentially incompatible uses. Supplementary Guidance is to be published on employment uses and this will clarify the range of uses acceptable in which areas.

No modification is proposed to the Plan.

Direct Flooring (10162/1/001): The site (S4_Doc_002) was formally a joinery workshop and has permission for the construction of three non class 1 units to allow the type of uses found in other part of Whitefrairs Industrial Estate. The allowance of class 1 retailing

would undermine the retail hierarchy and is in line with the reporter's decision in the 2009 planning appeal (S4_Doc_795) and (S4_Doc_796).

No modification is proposed to the Plan.

Murray Royal Hospital

Gannochy & Kinnoull Community Council (00667/2/001 & 00667/5/001); George Beaton (00742/3/001); Deirdre A Beaton (00741/3/001); Annelie Carmichael (00731/4/001); NHS Tayside (09094/2/001); John Munro (10277/1/009): In summer of 2012 NHS Tayside opened a new mental health facility to replace the existing hospital in what were the grounds of Murray Royal Hospital. The original existing buildings which are B listed and an area of associated grounds to the east are now surplus to NHS requirements. Prior to the closure NHS Tayside set up a surplus land and buildings group which consisted of various interest and community groups and stakeholders to discuss the re-use of the surplus land and buildings. The group met regularly between 2009 and 2012 though a consensus view on future use and funding did not emerge from the discussions. The existing buildings are important and contain many architectural features which are worthy of preservation. The Council carried out a heritage assessment of the site which sets out the historical context and importance of the buildings. (S4_Doc_168). The assessment recognises that there may be some scope for some new build in the far south eastern part of the site. The national (S4_Doc_308), (Core_Doc_026) and local policy (S4_Doc_484) framework for the listed buildings (and their setting) is that they be protected and remain in active use and that must be the primary concern of the policy framework for this site. The ideas that are suggested for community uses would be acceptable in principle but are not detailed proposals. The site is not well located for any new school provision and is not being actively considered by the Council. The representation from NHS Tayside suggests that the site measures 10ha however this area includes the listed buildings and their settings and any potential new build will be significantly less than this. While the site has the potential to make a useful contribution to the immediately available effective housing land supply it is not likely to be as much as 250 units but a clear idea of total numbers cannot be achieved until detailed design on the re-use of the listed buildings is undertaken. Not enough is known about the finer details of what will be a complex design process and consequently the site should not be identified as a development opportunity or housing site. There are also traffic issues affecting the local road network and Perth's bridges and any development is likely to require a traffic assessment which may also influence the capacity of the site. The policy framework contained in the LDP which allows a range of compatible residential uses with the overarching policy objective of protecting and re-using the listed buildings is an appropriate framework to guide any future development of the site.

No modification is proposed to the Plan.

Mount Tabor Road

Peter Tod (09142/3/002): The site (S4_Doc_002) which lies between Muirhall Road and Mount Tabor Road is a part of a network of open space which leads up out of Perth onto Kinnoull hill and the Sidlaws and is an important part of the character of the area. Paragraph 153 of SPP (S4_Doc_309) indicates that open space which is valued and contributes to local amenity should be protected and the site meets this criterion; the site having been identified as open space for over 20 years. The site is open when viewed from Muirhall Road and is in use as a paddock for grazing horses. The site lies immediately to the north and east of Gean Cottage which is B listed and the childhood home of Sir Patrick Geddes. Mount Tabor Road is at this point a narrow lane which becomes a footpath to the immediate east of the site. There is more vegetation on this

site boundary but the site is still visible and contributes significantly to the character of the area. The development of the site for five houses would impact on the semi rural nature of this part of Perth and remove the remaining context for Gean Cottage. The development of the site for 5 houses would have a limited impact on the housing land supply.

No modification is proposed to the Plan.

City Hall

Universities Superannuation Scheme Ltd (00844/1/013): In a letter dated 9 May 2012 Historic Scotland on behalf of Scottish Ministers refused the consent for the demolition of Perth City Hall and the construction of a new city square application 11/01083/LBC (S4_Doc_529). The Council are currently marketing the site but the result of this exercise will not be available for some time. The site is identified as lying within the prime retail core of the city centre and this would allow a wide variety of appropriate uses.

No modification is proposed to the Plan.

Pedestrian Bridge

Lynne Palmer (00239/4/002); Persephone Beer (07744/1/001): A pedestrian and cycle bridge linking the North Inch to the north end of the Isla road was taken to the preliminary design stage in 2008/2009. It was hoped that the Council and the Lottery/Sustrans would be able to fund the construction works which were estimated to be approximately £2,000,000, however more detailed costing revealed that the bridge was likely to cost in the order of £6,000, 000 which was beyond the cost acceptable to the potential funders. While the idea has merit the Council has no capital budget funding allocated to the project and there are no other likely sources of funding. There is no likelihood that the pedestrian bridge will be constructed during the life of the Plan and it should not therefore be identified as a proposal.

No modification is proposed to the Plan.

Former Nurses Home Taymount Terrace

NHS Tayside (09094/1/001): The site (S4_Doc_002) lies within an area identified for residential and compatible uses Policy RD1 (S4_Doc_405) within this area infill development is considered acceptable and there are five criteria which set out acceptable uses including residential, shopping, tourism, leisure, community and educational. The buildings are category C listed and the Council's policy in line with national guidance is that the buildings should be retained and remain in active use. Policy HE2 (S4_Doc_484) of the plan indicates that there is a presumption in favour of the retention and sympathetic restoration of listed buildings. The policy framework gives a lot of flexibility over potential uses with the prime consideration being the retention of the listed buildings. The site is small (0.5ha) and could only make a limited contribution to the effective housing land supply. The policy framework contained in the Plan is felt to be sufficiently clear to allow suitable development of the site.

No modification is proposed to the Plan.

Auction Mart

Perth City West LLP (09462/3/001): The Council have agreed (subject to a Section 75 agreement) to grant consent for a retail development and filling station on the site of the former Auction Mart. (Core_Doc_105) The Council decision means that it would be appropriate to identify the site as part of the commercial centre on this part of the Crieff

Road and extend the boundaries of the policy area accordingly.

Consequently in view of the above if the Reporter is so minded to recommend that the representation is accepted and the Plan modified to include an expanded site, the local authority would be comfortable with this modification because it would not have any implications for retailing or other policies within the LDP.

St John's Shopping Centre

Universities Superannuation Scheme Ltd (00844/1/021): It is not intended that the shopping centre be redeveloped during the life of the Plan and while there may be some scope for reconfiguration, it is not a site that should be identified for development purposes.

No modification is proposed to the Plan.

Reporter's conclusions:

Friarton Quarry

1. The site, of some, 20 hectares is located in a prominent position close to the southern boundary of the current built up area. Friarton quarry is a working quarry and the respondent has not provided any indication of either the quantity of material which remains to be extracted or the likely time horizon for that activity. Furthermore, there is no evidence that the potential of the site to accommodate residential or recreational uses has been adequately tested. Accordingly, any change from the current designation would be premature.

Riggs Road

2. An inspection of the site of the former Frews garage confirmed that there is housing in the immediate vicinity. However, the site is firmly located within an area where various employment uses predominate. While it is accepted that the site of the former Frews garage may not have attracted interest for some considerable time, the council elsewhere in its evidence has suggested that, at least in the short term, there may be a shortage of effective sites available for employment uses in the Perth core area. That said, attention was drawn in the conclusions to Issue 20b to the fragile nature of the council's methodology for forecasting the need for employment land over the plan period and beyond. The council will require to keep the estimates of future need under continuing review. In the meantime there is no justification for a modification to the Proposed Plan with respect to this site.

3. As far as the Direct Flooring site is concerned, a proposal for Class 1 Retail development at the site was refused by the council as detrimental to the vitality of the city centre. An appeal against the refusal was upheld by Scottish Ministers in a decision letter issued on 18 March 2010. The respondent seeks to achieve his desired outcome by way of another route. However, all the relevant matters were dealt with in the decision letter and there has been no change in circumstances which would justify an amendment to the Proposed Plan.

Murray Royal Hospital

4. The site identified as Murray Royal Hospital by the council and the respondents is located within a considerably larger area in the Kinnoull area identified on the Perth

Settlement Map as “*white land*”. The land referred to in evidence amounts to some 10 hectares. It includes the now redundant main building which is B listed. However, a reading of the associated documents confirms that areas within the redevelopment boundary include Pitcullen House, the Elcho and Birnam buildings and other historic ancillary structures such as the walled garden. The site also incorporates associated landscaped areas.

5. In response to a request for further information, the council confirmed that white land is unallocated land within the settlement boundary where proposals for development will be assessed against Policy RD1.

6. In a related request for information the council defined an opportunity site as a site which has development potential, perhaps for alternative uses, where the land/owner has indicated a willingness to release the site but where there may as yet be no definite commitment to a particular proposal.

7. In essence, NHS Tayside is promoting the site for inclusion within the Proposed Plan as suitable for an allocation of 250 houses while the council prefer that it remains as white land with any planning application to be assessed against all of the criteria set out in Policy RD1 as well as all other relevant policies of the plan. Other respondents advocate alternatives which suggest the allocation of the land as an opportunity site.

8. It has been concluded elsewhere in this report that there is no pressing need for an additional allocation of 250 houses within the core area in order to meet the requirements for housing land. Accordingly, there is no overwhelming need to amend the Proposed Plan to provide for the substantial number of houses advocated by NHS Tayside.

9. Although the group set up by NHS Tayside to consider the re-use of the surplus land and buildings met regularly between 2009 and 2012, no consensus was reached. Some of those divergences of view are reflected in the responses from parties summarised above. Although no planning allocation has been submitted it is possible to conclude that, on balance, NHS Tayside is committed to a definite proposal for the land to be allocated for housing. Accordingly, while there is obvious potential for uses other than housing in whole or part, it is appropriate for the site to remain as white land rather than be identified as an opportunity site.

10. In applying Policy RD1 to the *white land* it will be for the council to determine the weight to be given to the stated criteria in its second paragraph. However, it is noted in passing that in developing a master plan and associated development brief it will be possible to give consideration to the inclusion of ancillary uses other than housing including some provision for improvement to community and educational facilities as advocated by some of the respondents to the Proposed Plan.

Mount Tabor Road

11. The site is identified as open space in the Proposed Plan. There is no persuasive evidence to support the allocation of this sensitive site for housing within the plan. Any proposal for the development of this small plot of greenfield land can be readily considered at the development management stage within the framework provided by the policies of the Proposed Plan.

City Hall

12. Paragraph 5.2.1 provides an introductory description of the current (2013) position. The proposed modification amounts to a policy position and, hence, whatever its merits the proposed modification would be out of place.

13. There is no dispute that the creation of a major new civic space in St John's Square would further extend the use and attractiveness of the city centre of Perth. The respondent suggests one way in which this might be achieved. There are others. Any specific proposals which come forward can be dealt with within the context set by the policies of the Proposed Plan. There is no need for the additional policy which restricts the range of options available to the council.

Pedestrian Bridge

14. The council does not dispute that the provision of a pedestrian and cycle bridge linking the North Inch to the north end of the Isla road is a laudable aspiration. However, the capital cost of £6 million is beyond what can be funded from all available sources within the Proposed Plan period and the respondent has offered no advice in that respect. In these circumstances the council is correct in resisting the suggestion that it be identified as a proposal.

Former Nurses' Home at Taymount Terrace

15. Although located within easy walking distance of Perth Royal Infirmary the former nurses' home is located within a predominantly residential area. The respondent has provided no substantive reason for the allocation of the site for mixed uses other than it would provide greater certainty for the owners in planning for its future development. The aspirations of the owner do not carry sufficient weight to overcome the judgment of the council that proposals for the development of the C listed building and its immediate environs should fall to be considered under Policy RD1 which applies to areas identified of residential and compatible uses where existing residential amenity should be protected, and all other relevant policies of the Proposed Plan.

Auction Mart

16. The Council have agreed (subject to a Section 75 agreement) to grant consent for a retail development and filling station on the site of the former Auction Mart. Accordingly, it is no longer appropriate that the whole of the site be identified as "Employment – existing" within the Perth Settlement Map. The respondent's request for the allocation of this site as an opportunity site for a range of uses including retail, leisure and residential and the council's alternative proposal to identify the whole area as part of an enlarged commercial centre whose other components are situated to the east of the Crieff Road roundabout are considered under Issue 7.

Reporter's recommendation:Auction Mart

Remove the "*Employment Land – existing*" designation from the land to the west of the Crieff Road roundabout.