

## PERTH AND KINROSS COUNCIL

## Lifelong Learning Committee

9 March 2016

## Review of Instrumental Music Service

## Report by Director (Education and Children's Services)

**PURPOSE OF REPORT**

This report sets out improvement recommendations for the Instrumental Music Service which aim to increase participation by children and young people, make best use of resources and deliver a required saving of £75,000 from April 2016.

**1. INTRODUCTION**

As part of the Council's wider approach to continuous improvement through service transformation a review of the IMS (Instrumental Music Service) has been carried out.

1.2 The review **aim** was to investigate how the IMS can best develop the musical talent and wider life skills of our children and young people as inclusively as possible, whilst making best use of resources and delivering an agreed £75,000 saving (report [14/44](#) refers) from April 2016.

1.3 The review **objectives** were to:

- Review current data and evidence about how the IMS is used to identify the needs and priorities of service users/non users, and identify any gaps in provision.
- Refresh the future key outcomes for the service, in line with national and local strategic priorities.
- Review how resources (people, skills, time and money) are currently aligned to deliver outcomes.
- Investigate partnership opportunities for children and young people to develop their talent/potential beyond school tuition.
- Review current income streams including charges and external funding to see how these can be maximised to broaden access to the service.
- Deliver a required saving of £75,000.

1.4 The service in scope of this review is the music tuition provided **in addition to** teaching of music provided within the area of Expressive Arts as an integral part of the Curriculum for Excellence (CfE). The service in scope of review is outlined at **paragraph 2.3**, below. All services in scope are delivered both within and after school hours: immediately after the school day, in the evenings or weekends.

- 1.5 The review was carried out from September 2014 – June 2015 via a Project Team chaired by the Service Manager, Culture and comprising expertise from Education Services, ECS Finance, ECS Change and Improvement and HR. IMS staff, including the IMS Coordinator, were part of the Project Team.
- 1.6 Evidence reviewed by the Project Team included:
- The current activities delivered by IMS across Perth and Kinross Schools;
  - Participation data;
  - Financial data (cost of delivering the service and income streams);
  - Staffing levels and the range of expertise amongst the staff team;
  - Benchmarking information from other services across Scotland drawn from the Scottish Government report, Instrumental Music Tuition in Scotland (June 2013) and follow up published February 2015;<sup>12</sup>
  - Previous Service evaluations drawn from Big Listen 1 and 2 (2011 and 2013) and Education Scotland Learning Community Inspections including those for Crieff, Pitlochry and North Inch in Perth.

## 2. BACKGROUND/MAIN ISSUES

### 2.1 National requirements for Music Tuition

In Scotland, music is taught by General Teaching Council of Scotland (GTCS) registered teachers as part of the Expressive Arts curriculum from Primary 1 to Secondary 3. Expressive Arts is defined as comprising art/design, dance, drama and music. There is no statutory requirement to include a minimum level of instrumental music tuition within the wider Expressive Arts component of CfE but it is important that children have well planned experiences and outcomes across all curricular areas. It is part of the broad general education which pupils receive and supports development of wider life skills and capacities as defined within CfE (successful learners; confident individuals; responsible citizens; effective contributors).

In the senior phase (Secondary 4 – 6), pupils can opt to take National (Scottish Qualification Authority, SQA) Qualification courses in music, for which they must learn two different instruments, and which they can pursue to Higher and Advanced Higher level.

### 2.2 Recent national improvement recommendations

The Scottish Government reports cited in **paragraph 1.6** focused on music tuition provided beyond these core general education requirements, and is focused on extra-curricular services such as the IMS in scope of this review.

Recommendations included:

- The need to **strengthen partnerships between formal and informal tuition providers** so that children and young people have a wider range

---

<sup>1</sup> [Instrumental Music Report 2013](#)

<sup>2</sup> [Instrumental Music Follow Up Report 2015](#)

of ways to participate in and enjoy music (for example, singing in community choirs).

- The need to **widen access to participation** in music so that those facing financial or other barriers are not excluded. This recommendation has subsequently been underlined by the Scottish Government’s wider emphasis on tackling inequality and closing the attainment gap.
- The need for **local authorities to share best practice** and resources more effectively, including specialist training to support pupils with additional support needs;
- The need for **local authorities to seek new income streams** more proactively, including sponsorship; and
- That **tuition should be free for pupils being presented for an SQA exam**. In Perth and Kinross pupils receive free tuition at all stages of their SQA study. In almost all other local authorities, tuition is free in the year where the pupil is presented for the SQA exam.

### 2.3 Current IMS provision

Perth and Kinross Council IMS was founded in 1965 and is one of the oldest in Scotland, with a very strong reputation for fostering talent in children and young people. It currently offers four services beyond the broad general education in music outlined in **paragraph 2.1**. These are outlined in **Table 1** below. The overall focus of the service is on instrument tuition, much of which can be taught in group settings (e.g. woodwind, strings and brass).

**Table 1: Services currently provided by the IMS**

<b>Format</b>	<b>Instruments taught</b>	<b>Primary/ Secondary</b>	<b>Fee</b>
<b>Small group (max 8 pupils) &amp; 1-2-1 tuition</b> in schools. 30 sessions per pupil Aug-June of between 20-40 mins duration and delivered during the school day. <sup>3</sup>	Strings, brass, woodwind and percussion. Vocal, guitar and bagpipe tuition is also offered. Charge includes loan of an instrument if required.	In all secondary schools and in most primary schools.	Y <sup>4</sup>
<b>Central Groups</b> bands of different instruments taught at North Inch Community Campus and delivered in the evenings between October and March each year.	Currently includes brass, guitar and keyboards. 12 Groups running in total.	Mainly secondary	Y <sup>5</sup>
<b>Music Camps</b> 4 day annual residentials at Junior,	Strings, brass, woodwind, percussion, vocal and guitar	Primary & secondary	Y <sup>7</sup>

<sup>3</sup> Lesson length is in line with that offered in all other Councils (average 30 mins).

<sup>4</sup> £245.85 for 30 sessions over one year. Exemptions apply to parents/carers on Employment Support Allowance, Income Based Job Seeker Allowance and Universal Credit and to those studying for an SQA. The charge is the same for group or 1-2-1 tuition.

<sup>5</sup> £81.05 with no additional charge for joining additional Groups.

Intermediate and Senior level. <sup>6</sup>			
<b>Cool Schools</b> informal Saturday morning sessions offered across all clusters	Less formal musical forms – drumming, samba etc	P5-P7	N <sup>8</sup>

## 2.4 Current resource base

The allocated funding and core income sources for delivering these four services are shown in **Table 2** below. The level of investment which Perth and Kinross Council makes in the IMS is at the higher end amongst Scottish Councils, although comparisons are not straightforward because geography, demographics and types of service offered differ greatly across 32 Councils.

**Table 2: Core funding and core income sources**

<b>Perth &amp; Kinross Budget allocations: (2015/16)</b>	
Staffing	789,452
Transport <sup>9</sup>	47,525
Supplies & Services	16,244
Property costs (Music Camps)	45,000
<b>Total PKC annual core funding</b>	<b>898,221</b>
<b>Youth Music Initiative Grant funding</b>	<b>273,328<sup>10</sup></b>
<b>Total annual budget</b>	<b>1,171,549</b>
Income from tuition fees (primary & secondary)	208,980
Income from Central Group fees	45,797
Income from Music Camp fees	51,000
<b>Total income from fees</b>	<b>305,777</b>
<b>Youth Music Initiative Grant Funding</b>	<b>273,328</b>
<b>Current net service delivery budget (annual budget less income from fees)</b>	<b>592,444</b>

## 2.5 Staff resource and deployment

The budgeted staff resource to deliver services comprises **17.93** FTE core instructors, plus **5.34** FTE funded through the YMI annual grant. (23.27FTE in total.) Work is currently being undertaken by the GTCS to register all music instructors with guidance and criteria for this due in 2016.

The IMS is a peripatetic service, meaning that staff are managed and allocated to schools centrally by the IMS Co-ordinator. The peripatetic model has two key implications:

<sup>7</sup> £250 for attendance at one residential Camp.

<sup>6</sup> Lowest uptake is at Intermediate level, with the maximum number of attendees in the last 4 years at 100.

<sup>8</sup> Funded by YMI

<sup>9</sup> Transport costs include transport to Music Camps and events, but exclude transport to Central Groups. This is paid for directly by the Perth Central Groups Transport Association.

<sup>10</sup> YMI funding has been fixed at this level for the past 3 years.

- A lot of central officer time is spent organising timetables/staff work patterns and managing staff performance and continuing professional development. In effect the Coordinator has 29 direct reports.
- The review found that the connections made between peripatetic IMS staff and core teaching staff (both primary teachers who are qualified to teach all parts of the primary curriculum, and Principal Teachers of Music in secondary schools) could be improved. IMS staff are generally only in schools for the time allocated to prepare for and deliver tuition.

### 3. REVIEW FINDINGS

3.1 The key findings from the review against each of the review objectives are summarised in **Table 6** (para 3.16) and relate to:

- Usage: overall participation in the IMS
- Data from a survey of current service users carried out in spring 2015
- Demand levels
- Usage: inclusion
- Benchmarking information from the 2013 national report on music tuition
- How current resources are allocated within the IMS
- Additional income sources
- Wider provision apart from that available from the IMS

#### 3.2 Usage

The review examined usage over the past 4 years to identify the priorities and needs of users, and any gaps in provision. Tuition forms the backbone of the service and is provided in small groups or 1-2-1 sessions. 1-2-1 tuition will be used where, for example, only one pupil is learning a particular instrument or where the music instructor judges they would benefit from additional support. This may be for a number of reasons.

Overall participation

3.3 The review found that approximately **10%** of the total current primary/secondary school population (17,821 pupils) are currently using the IMS in some way. The breakdown of pupils participating for the past 4 years is shown in **Table 3** below. It shows usage rather than user numbers, because some pupils will be participating in more than one activity (for example receiving tuition and being part of a Central Group). Roughly 50% of pupils receiving tuition are in primary schools, and 50% in secondary schools.

**Table 3: Overall participation in the 4 IMS services**

Session	Number of Pupils Participating in IMS Activities			
	Instrumental Music Tuition	Central Music Groups	Cool Schools	Music Camps
2011-12	1835	757	182	434
2012-13	1823	788	192	405

2013-14	1803	693 <sup>11</sup>	180	389 <sup>12</sup>
2014-15	1719	698	138	365

### User Survey spring 2015: key findings

3.4 In April and May this year, a survey of parents, carers, pupils, school staff and the wider public was undertaken. There were **826 respondents**, of which 451 were parents or carers and 222 were pupils using the service. 37 respondents did not currently make use of the service. The survey confirmed the high value placed on services by users with 86.4% of parents and carers satisfied with the service, 94.2% identifying music as an essential element of their child's education and 86.6% identifying an increase in their child's confidence as a result of their participation in music tuition to identify service improvements. Pupils responding to the survey identified satisfaction rates of 95.5% and 88.7% of pupils felt their confidence had improved as a result of taking part in music tuition, 86.3% also identified that music would continue to be important to them after leaving school.

Areas highlighted for improvement from the responses included:

- Simplifying the process for payment of tuition fees
- Improving the information provided to parents, carers, pupils and schools before taking up tuition and once enrolled.
- The difficulties of getting a place of choice of instrument due to demand of tutor availability
- Application processes for Tuition, Central Groups and Music Camps not being efficient
- Choice in range/style of music studied

### Demand levels

3.5 The review found that **60%** of pupils who apply for music tuition are currently successful. This means waiting lists can total 600-700 pupils in an academic year. The review looked at the possible causes of this unmet demand. One reason may be that once a pupil is accepted for tuition at primary school, to date their re-enrolment is assumed each year with parents and carers automatically receiving an application for tuition to continue each year without an option to consider and confirm if they wish their child to continue. This reduced the opportunity for those on waiting lists or who have joined a school mid-way through the academic year, and has now been removed. In addition, there is no regular review of demand requirements across all schools. This means staff are allocated to schools on an historical basis rather than in response to new or changing needs and priorities.

### Inclusion

3.6 The review identified some important issues in relation to inclusion:

<sup>11</sup> The 2013/14 figures for Central Groups and Music Camps are lower because choir/vocal was not offered in this year due to the vocal teaching post being vacant. This has previously attracted an average of 50 additional participants.

<sup>12</sup> As above.

- 27 pupils from the current total 1719 currently receiving tuition are exempt from fees specifically because they are from a low income household<sup>13</sup>.
- Just over 210 pupils taking part in Central Groups live outside Perth, and therefore need transport to/from North Inch Community Campus. This transport is arranged and funded in part by the Perth Central Groups Transport Association.
- No Looked After children and young people are currently using IMS. The review could not identify complete data for previous years, but from the data we do have there appears to be little/no uptake from this group.
- There are very small numbers of pupils with additional support needs using the service.<sup>14</sup>

3.7 The review examined national findings from the Improvement Service recent reports on music tuition in relation to whether fees were a significant barrier to access. The Improvement Service concluded that there is currently no evidence that charging for music tuition has a detrimental impact on pupil numbers or equality of opportunity. This conclusion is partly drawn from the fact that all Councils including Perth and Kinross offer concessions. Additionally the Perth and Kinross Music Foundation (see Table 5) offers grants for tuition fees and other costs for pupils on low incomes or in other exceptional circumstances. However the Improvement Service report also cautioned that concessionary schemes should be regularly reviewed to ensure they are reaching those who will benefit most.

### Benchmarking Findings

3.8 The review looked at data<sup>15</sup> to see how the service compares to others in relation to:

- Fees charged for the service
- Overall participation levels
- Access and inclusion.

3.9 In relation to these areas, it identified the following points summarised in Table 4 below:

**Table 4: Key benchmarking findings**

<b>Fees</b>	Perth and Kinross IMS levies the fourth highest charge for tuition in the country, after Highland Council (£272), Aberdeen City Council (£272-£340) and Aberdeenshire (£192-£284). Higher charges tend to apply in Councils delivering services over large geographies servicing significant rural areas. This is a significant challenge in Perth and Kinross, which is the fourth largest geographical area in Scotland.
-------------	--

<sup>13</sup> The IMS defines 'low income households as those in receipt of Employment Support Allowance, Income Based Job Seeker Allowance (JSA) and Universal Credit. Receipt of JSA is a proxy indicator of low income and a household in receipt of two or more benefits is a proxy indicator for child poverty.

<sup>14</sup> Data is dependent on schools notifying IMS staff of pupils formally registered with ASN. Tuition is provided at Fairview school which supports children with ASN.

<sup>15</sup> Source: *Instrumental Music Tuition*, The Improvement Service, 2014. Geographies and demographics vary significantly across all 32 Councils so these are not direct like-for-like comparisons.

	<p>9 Councils do not charge (although some costs may apply for instrument hire). The remainder charge between £95-£220.</p> <p>All Scottish Councils now provide free tuition for SQA pupils in the year they present for the SQA examination. Perth and Kinross provides free tuition for SQA pupils in all years they are studying for the examination.</p> <p>All Councils provide some kind of concession for pupils from a low income household.</p>
<b>Overall participation</b>	Perth and Kinross has an average overall participation rate at 9-10% of the total school population. The highest participation levels (17-19%) were in island authorities with smaller populations (Shetland, Orkney).
<b>Access and inclusion</b>	<p>2013/2014 figures<sup>16</sup> showed Perth and Kinross had one of the lowest number of pupils (2%) using the IMS who were eligible for free school meals, using FSM as an indicator of low household income. Angus, Fife, Stirling and Aberdeen City had between 13-23%.</p> <p>60% of pupils applying for tuition in Perth and Kinross are currently successful. Data is not available for all 32 Councils, but this is similar to rates in Stirling (65%), Aberdeen City (61%) and East Renfrewshire (66%). Application processes vary significantly. Perth and Kinross tests all applicants prior to selection, as do many other Councils, because demand frequently outstrips supply.</p>

## Current Resource Allocation

3.10 The review examined how staff and financial resources are currently deployed to deliver the service. It found:

- **89%** (£1,038,743) of the total budget is allocated to staff salaries (including YMI funded posts)<sup>17</sup>
- In total this provides **448** teaching hours per week across those primary and secondary schools currently receiving tuition (excluding staff time spent on travel, preparation etc)
- Within the staffing budgets approx. **£100,000**<sup>18</sup> per year is spent on supply staff and additional hours annually, largely to operate Central Groups and Music Camps which run in the evenings/school holidays.
- Approx. **£82,000**<sup>19</sup> is spent on staff travelling to schools across Perth and Kinross to deliver tuition, and on transport hire.
- The ratio of staff:pupils provided for Music Camps and Central Groups is high; on average 1:12 (average of 18 staff at each camp). It is adjusted to support pupils with ASN however not always adjusted to lower levels of demand, for example at the Intermediate Music Camp which has achieved a maximum 100 attendees in the last four years.

3.11 The review examined the cost of delivering group and 1-2-1 tuition, as the largest component of the service. The cost to the Council of providing a pupil with 30 tuition sessions annually is approximately **£424** (staff tuition time & travel costs, excluding instrument purchase/other materials/premises costs).

<sup>16</sup> i.e. prior to the introduction of free school meals for all pupils in 2014/15

<sup>17</sup> 2015/16 Budgeted figure

<sup>18</sup> 2014/15 Actual (£99,944)

<sup>19</sup> 2014/15 Actual (£81,792)

Approximately 48% of pupils pay for tuition at a charge of £245.85. The income generated from this fee provides approximately 28% of the actual cost.

- 3.12 Approximately **52%** of pupils receive free IMS tuition. This figure includes 41% of pupils studying for an SQA award as detailed in para 3.14 with the remaining 11% comprises pupils from low income households (27 pupils) who receive exemptions and pupils receiving tuition funded by the Youth Music Initiative (for example, guitar tuition which is fully funded by YMI).

#### Income sources

- 3.13 The review examined the range of income sources for the IMS outwith the core revenue funding provided by the Council.
- 3.14 As Table 1 shows, tuition fees plus Central Group and Music Camp fees form a substantial income stream for the IMS. The review found that **41%** of pupils receiving tuition were exempt from paying tuition fees because they were studying for an SQA. Whilst this figure may include pupils from low income backgrounds as well, it means that these pupils are much more highly subsidised than in other Councils which charge fees, all of which exempt SQA pupils from fees only in the year they are presented for their exam.
- 3.15 Whilst not counted as core income, the IMS receives substantial support from local volunteer groups, dedicated to fundraising for many years. Key additional income is shown in Table 5 below.

**Table 5: Additional Income Sources**

<b>Group</b>	<b>Average Annual Contribution</b>
Young Musicians Parents' Association	£8,700
Perth and Kinross Music Foundation (funds tuition fees for pupils not otherwise exempt)	£15,000
Perth Youth Orchestra (instrument purchase, repair, rehearsal costs)	£5,000
<b>Total</b>	<b>£28,700</b>

- 3.16 The IMS applies for additional funding annually from the Scottish Government Youth Music Initiative (YMI). This funding programme has been running for over a decade and is used by IMS to deliver extra free tuition in guitar and vocal, and to run the Saturday morning 'Cool Schools' sessions which are also free. However this way of utilising the YMI funding has caused confusion at times about why some instruments can be learned for free and others are charged.
- 3.17 There is currently no sponsorship in place for the IMS from local/regional businesses.

#### Wider Provision

3.18 In considering improvement whilst also delivering a £75,000 saving, the review looked at the extent of music provision available elsewhere in Perth and Kinross. This is important to ensure the IMS is clearly focused on providing a service which is accessible to as many children and young people as possible, without duplicating other provision. The review found:

- Whilst the IMS focus is largely on orchestral music, there is high quality provision elsewhere in traditional Scottish music including that delivered by Horsecross Arts, the George Duncan Experience and local pipe bands.
- The Gannochy Trust funds the annual programme of Scottish Chamber Orchestra concerts at Horsecross Arts including creative learning activities for schools.
- In addition, Horsecross Arts is developing stronger relationships with the Royal Scottish National Orchestra (RSNO) and Scottish Opera to ensure these National Companies provide high quality outreach programmes in Perth and Kinross, including in schools. The IMS and Horsecross have occasionally worked in partnership on these programmes, for example on providing masterclasses and the 'Side by Side' initiative where pupils were mentored by RSNO musicians.
- There are a significant number of local community choirs, including Gaelic choirs, in the area providing a range of vocal opportunities.

3.19 Key review findings in relation to the review objectives set out in para 1.3 are summarised in Table 6, below.

**Table 6 Key review findings**

Objective	Finding
<p>1. Review current data and evidence about how the IMS is used to ensure needs and priorities of service users and non users are understood and any gaps in provision.</p>	<p>There is a significant level of unmet demand across Perth and Kinross schools as a whole, although benchmarking data showed that this is not uncommon across Scotland.</p> <p>The number of pupils accessing the service from low income backgrounds, who are looked after/in care, or who have additional support needs, is very low.</p> <p>Not all primary schools currently have access to the IMS (10 primary schools currently have no provision). There is regular review of requirements across all schools; however there are only limited opportunities to ensure resources are aligned to changing needs and demands.</p> <p>The number of pupils travelling to Central Groups from outside Perth suggests there may be demand for more group tuition in rural areas whilst recognising the benefits of pupils meeting and learning with others from outwith their local community.</p>
<p>2.Refresh the future key outcomes for the</p>	<p>Evidence about wider provision in Perth and</p>

<b>Objective</b>	<b>Finding</b>
service, in line with national and local strategic priorities	<p>Kinross suggests there is a good range of opportunities for children and young people to participate in music, particularly in relation to vocal and traditional music.</p> <p>As the data examined in relation to Objective 1 shows, there is scope to widen inclusion.</p> <p>The IMS current focus is on orchestral music. However there is scope to vary the range of instruments, including to reflect other cultures and traditions beyond Scotland/Europe and to engage children and young people for whom orchestral tuition may not be the best way to engage them in music.</p>
3. Review how resources (people, skills, time and money) are currently aligned to deliver required outcomes	<p>The current peripatetic model means a lot of central staff time is expended on organising timetables and managing IMS staff performance and development.</p> <p>The geography of Perth and Kinross means a lot of expenditure is used to meet staff travel costs.</p> <p>There is some scope to align staff more efficiently across the school clusters, helping to widen access. There is also scope to reduce the teacher ratio at Music Camps without impacting on service quality.</p> <p>The role of Principal Teachers of Music in secondary schools in working with IMS staff could be strengthened to make best use of overall teaching expertise.</p> <p>The service should move into the remit of Secondary and Inclusion Services within Education and Children's Services. This will allow further work to ensure staff resources are well aligned to both current and future demand, and music tuition is well integrated with delivery of the wider CfE, with IMS staff working more closely alongside other teaching staff. It would also ensure that a robust approach is taken to quality assurance and service improvement planning.</p>
4. Investigate partnership opportunities for children and young people to develop their talent/potential beyond school tuition	Collaborative working with key partners could be strengthened to maximise joint resources.
5. Review current income streams including charges and external funding to see how these can be maximised to broaden access to the service	The level of income generated from current tuition fees is crucial for maintaining the service because the unit cost (tuition per pupil for one year) is high at £424. This is partly due to the geography of Perth and

Objective	Finding
	<p>Kinross which requires significant expenditure on travel. However savings could be achieved by aligning staff more efficiently across each of the Local Management Groups.</p> <p>Benchmarking data indicates that charges could be varied to avoid blanket increases, but also bring the IMS into line with charging structures elsewhere in order to achieve savings.</p> <p>The way in which current YMI funding is used to provide free guitar and vocal tuition can be confusing for parents/carers and may not be the best means to encourage wider inclusion. This is currently being reviewed.</p> <p>Sponsorship for the service is not currently obtained.</p>

#### 4. PROPOSALS FOR SERVICE REDESIGN

4.1 The review looked closely at the opportunities to redesign the service including potential to introduce an element of free tuition, or replacing tuition at primary level with sessions delivered as part of the core school day to provide an inclusive introductory focus on music as part of the Expressive Arts component of the curriculum. This could include for example, working with a local community choir or exploring a particular instrument or musical form over the course of a term. However scope to introduce a significantly different service model was limited for the following reasons:

- There is limited scope to vary the current IMS staff levels during an academic session due to the need for continuity in tuition for pupils.
- There is limited scope to introduce free provision because income from fees is a key part of the current funding base for the service. Introducing an element of free tuition (for example at primary level) whilst also achieving the required saving of £75,000 would mean increasing fees significantly in other parts of the service. This introduces the risk of reducing overall participation and increasing the barriers for those who do not currently use the IMS.
- Because of the geography of Perth and Kinross, there is an element of relatively high fixed costs in relation to staff travel and transport.

4.1.1 The review therefore makes the following recommendations to strengthen and refocus the current IMS model whilst achieving the required savings:

**Table 7: Review Recommendations**

Recommendation	Saving
<p>Develop relationships with primary schools to include a target of reaching all Primary Schools by allocating staff to localities, based at the 4 Hub Community Campuses plus Viewlands (Perth High and Perth Academy Cluster) and Rattray Community Hub (Blairgowrie cluster).</p> <p>Staff time can be used to deliver tuition or where there is low tuition demand to support Expressive Arts delivery, e.g. providing on-site support for existing choirs/music groups or working 1-2-1 with pupils who have additional needs.</p> <p>Staff would still work from the current Music Centre at North Inch Community Campus for delivery of Central Groups, contact and professional development time, etc.</p>	<p>£5,000 from travel costs by reviewing the weekly requirement to travel from the current base location for all IMS staff. This will not impact on current levels of teaching provision.</p>
<p>Redefine the role of the Music Coordinator in light of strengthened working relationship with PT Music staff to focus on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Reviewing demand levels annually so that provision is well tailored to need and resources are more effectively aligned.</li> <li>• Increasing overall participation levels.</li> <li>• Reducing barriers to accessing the IMS, by promoting the IMS to current non-user groups, including equalities groups, alongside promoting grants and concessions to help with fees for those groups.</li> </ul>	<p>Nil, although will support efficiencies in service delivery.</p>
<p>Identifying new income stream opportunities including potential for sponsorship.</p>	<p>£13,000 pa additional income target, this will include income from ticket sales, sponsorship and fundraising activity.</p>
<p>Retain free tuition for SQA students</p>	<p>£34,000<sup>20</sup></p>

<sup>20</sup> this figure assumes participation at current rates with fee exemptions for families on low incomes, a 10% drop off would deliver approx. £31k saving and a 20% drop off would deliver approx. £28k saving

<p>only in either S4, S5 or S6 who are following a full year SQA programme in line with other Councils. Concessions for pupils on low incomes would still apply.</p>	
<p>Redesign Youth Music Initiative application to focus on widening participation amongst target groups including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Retain YMI funded P6 provision</li> <li>• Introduce tailored provision at Fairview and Almondbank.</li> <li>• Introduce free informal evening/weekend sessions at Scott Street and within youth services delivered in localities</li> <li>• Introduce a pilot Central Group model in 1 locality during 2016/17 to assess level of additional demand/provide a more accessible service to pupils living in rural locations.</li> <li>• Retain a reduced Cool Schools universal provision across all school clusters.</li> <li>• Review free vocal and guitar tuition.</li> </ul> <p>It is also recommended that future YMI applications are developed in consultation with key forums for example the PKAVS Young Carers Project, Minority Ethnic Access Development, the Youth Council etc.</p>	<p>Nil. Cost neutral – request YMI funding for this pilot in 2016/17.</p>
<p>Review in more detail the Music Camp model and how this might be redesigned and further developed whilst continuing to ensure the teacher; pupil ratio meets statutory requirements and risk assessments for excursions but does not exceed tuition demands for each instrument.</p>	<p>£14,000</p>
<p>Delete a vacant tutor post.</p>	<p>£8,000</p>
<p>Introduce an additional fee level for pupils joining more than one Central Group. Membership of 1 CG would remain at £81. Membership of two or more CG would increase to £115. There would be no limit on the number</p>	<p>£2,600</p>

of additional CG which can be joined for this higher fee. Pupils attending a second group to support the completion a recognised volunteering award (i.e. Duke of Edinburgh, Saltire Award) would be exempt from this charge.	
Investigate scope for ongoing collaboration with Horsecross Arts in relation to traditional music provision and opportunities to widen engagement with the National Companies.	Nil, though there will be time efficiencies from sharing skills, information about service user/non user needs, etc.
<b>TOTAL SAVINGS</b>	<b>£76,600</b>

In addition to the recommendations identified above, further options were also investigated which, whilst **not recommended** as a result of this review, may require to be revisited in the future should further savings be identified for the service. These options are:

- Reviewing the current fee structure and increasing income targets associated with this, enabling a level of free tuition to continue for pupils from low income households.
- Reducing the scope of the service to focus on supporting pupils to develop their instrumental skills in secondary school, including achieving SQA qualifications.

## 5 CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

- 5.1 A review of the Instrumental Music Service has been completed in line with the Council's wider approach to continuous improvement. Data from a number of sources, set out in para 1.6, has been examined to inform the review findings.
- 5.2 In summary, the IMS was found to be highly regarded by those who use it although there is scope to make the service more inclusive. The service benefits from strong parental support and fundraising by a number of parent-led groups, alongside the Council's substantial annual investment in the service.
- 5.3 The review found limited scope to introduce a significantly different delivery model. However it identified scope to:
- widen inclusion amongst key groups of children and young people who face barriers of various kinds to participating in musical activities, including learning an instrument;
  - use resources more efficiently and effectively;
  - create added value from more integrated working between IMS staff and other teaching staff, plus wider partners in particular Horsecross Arts;
  - generate more income;
  - bring fee arrangements for SQA students in line with those applied in many other Councils;

- re-focus national funding received via the Youth Music Initiative on increasing inclusion; and
- improve process for communication with schools, pupils and parents/carers

5.4 It is recommended that the Committee:

- approves** the recommendations set out in Table 7 of this report; and
- instructs** the Director (Education and Children's Services) to bring back an update report in 2017.

#### Author(s)

Name	Designation	Contact Details
Fiona Robertson	Head of Public Service Reform, Culture & Community Development	<a href="mailto:FionaRobertson@pkc.gov.uk">FionaRobertson@pkc.gov.uk</a> 01738 476270

#### Approved

Name	Designation	Date
Sheena Devlin	<b>Director, (Education and Children's Services)</b>	23 February 2016

If you or someone you know would like a copy of this document in another language or format, (on occasion, only a summary of the document will be provided in translation), this can be arranged by contacting the Customer Service Centre on 01738 475000.

You can also send us a text message on 07824 498145.

All Council Services can offer a telephone translation facility.

## 1. IMPLICATIONS, ASSESSMENTS, CONSULTATION AND COMMUNICATION

<b>Strategic Implications</b>	<b>Yes / None</b>
Community Plan / Single Outcome Agreement	Yes
Corporate Plan	Yes
<b>Resource Implications</b>	
Financial	Yes
Workforce	Yes
Asset Management (land, property, IST)	None
<b>Assessments</b>	
Equality Impact Assessment	Yes
Strategic Environmental Assessment	None
Sustainability (community, economic, environmental)	None
Legal and Governance	None
Risk	Yes
<b>Consultation</b>	
Internal	Yes
External	Yes
<b>Communication</b>	
Communications Plan	Yes

### 1. Strategic Implications

#### Community Plan / Single Outcome Agreement

1.1 This section should set out how the proposals relate to the delivery of the Perth and Kinross Community Plan / Single Outcome Agreement in terms of the following priorities:

- (i) Giving every child the best start in life
- (ii) Developing educated, responsible and informed citizens
- (iii) Promoting a prosperous, inclusive and sustainable economy
- (iv) Supporting people to lead independent, healthy and active lives
- (v) Creating a safe and sustainable place for future generations

This report relates to Objective No (i) and (ii).

#### Corporate Plan

1.2 The Perth and Kinross Community Plan 2013-2023 and Perth and Kinross Council Corporate Plan 2013/2018 set out five strategic objectives:

- (i) Giving every child the best start in life;
- (ii) Developing educated, responsible and informed citizens;
- (iii) Promoting a prosperous, inclusive and sustainable economy;
- (iv) Supporting people to lead independent, healthy and active lives; and
- (v) Creating a safe and sustainable place for future generations.

This report relates to Objective No (i) and (ii)

1.3 The report also links to the Education & Children's Services Policy Framework in respect of the following key policy area:

- Change and Improvement

## 2. Resource Implications

### Financial

2.1 There are financial implications to this report. If the recommendations are approved amendments to fees for IMS services will be implemented from April 2016 onwards. A targeted saving of £75,000 will be achieved.

### Workforce

2.2 There are workforce implications to this report. Some staff base locations will change from North Inch Community Campus to locality bases around Perth and Kinross to reduce travel costs and introduce time efficiencies. Staff will be consulted on any changes in line with normal procedures.

### Asset Management (land, property, IT)

2.3 There are no asset management implications to this report.

## 3. Assessments

### Equality Impact Assessment

3.1 Under the Equality Act 2010, the Council is required to eliminate discrimination, advance equality of opportunity, and foster good relations between equality groups. Carrying out Equality Impact Assessments for plans and policies allows the Council to demonstrate that it is meeting these duties. This report has been assessed as **relevant** for the purposes of EqiA. The Equality Impact Assessment undertaken in relation to this report can be viewed clicking [here](#).

### Strategic Environmental Assessment

3.2 The Environmental Assessment (Scotland) Act 2005 places a duty on the Council to identify and assess the environmental consequences of its proposals.

This section should reflect that the proposals have been considered under the Act and no further action is required as it does not qualify as a PPS as defined by the Act and is therefore exempt.

### Sustainability

3.3 Under the provisions of the Local Government in Scotland Act 2003 the Council has to discharge its duties in a way which contributes to the achievement of sustainable development. In terms of the Climate Change Act,

the Council has a general duty to demonstrate its commitment to sustainability and the community, environmental and economic impacts of its actions. This report is assessed as **not relevant** for the purposes of sustainable development.

### Legal and Governance

3.4 There are no legal implications to this report.

### Risk

3.5 A full risk assessment will be developed for the implementation of the review recommendations if approved. Currently the key risks identified in relation to these recommendations are:

<b>Risk</b>	<b>Mitigation</b>
There is a risk that staff affected by the recommendations (IMS and Principal Teachers of Music) do not engage with implementation of the changes.	Consultation and engagement with staff Jan-March 2016. Effective staff communications plan Training and development support for staff, including wider support associated with the Transformation Programme. IMS staff will be briefed on the Review recommendations on 29 February.
There is a risk that parents/carers are concerned about the impact of the changes on their children/young people.	Effective early communication with parents/carers about the changes and key benefits such as more equitable provision in primary schools, new targeted activities to be funded by YMI; and provide assurance about what will continue unchanged.
There is a risk that schools and other teaching staff do not engage with implementation of the changes.	Early engagement with schools and teaching staff to communicate the changes and key benefits.
There is a risk that a revised YMI funding application is not successful.	Early engagement with Creative Scotland to set out the purpose of the changes, the new user groups which it is intended to target and provide assurance about what will continue unchanged.
There is a risk that additional income from sponsorship is not achieved	Training and support for relevant staff.

## **4. Consultation**

### Internal

4.1 The following have been consulted in the preparation of this report:

- Director, Education and Children's Services
- Head of Secondary and Inclusion, Education and Children's Services
- Head of Early Years and Primary, Education and Children's Services
- Head of Cultural and Community Services, ECS
- Head of Children and Families Services, ECS
- Instrumental Music Service Co-ordinator
- Finance Manager, Education and Children's Services
- Personnel Officer, Human Resources
- PKC Executive Officer Team

### External

4.2 The recommendations of this report have not be subject to external consultation, however an extensive survey of current service users, (pupils, parents, carers and school staff), has significantly informed the findings of the review.

## **5. Communication**

5.1 If approved, the changes resulting from the review recommendations will be communicated to service users, current non users and wider stakeholders by:

- Letter to all parents/carers with children currently receiving tuition, explaining the changes and the rationale for them
- Wider promotion of the additional services to be provided to strengthen inclusion via the Council website and social media
- A briefing will be given to Parent Groups working closely with the IMS on 4 March 2016.

## **2. BACKGROUND PAPERS**

No background papers, as defined by Section 50D of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973 (other than any containing confidential or exempt information) were relied on to any material extent in preparing the above report.